|  |
| --- |
| **National Outcomes for Scotland**  **Consultation with Parliament in connection with the Review of National Outcomes**  Laid before the Scottish Parliament by the Scottish Ministers on 1 May 2024, in accordance with section 2(6) of the Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015 |

Purpose

1. This document supports consideration by the Scottish Parliament of proposed changes to the National Outcomes for Scotland. It describes the process through which representatives of communities in Scotland and others have been consulted as part of a review of the National Outcomes, the results of that consultation, and how the representations received have been taken account of in preparing proposed revisions to the National Outcomes. It forms part of the process of consulting the Scottish Parliament on proposed changes to the National Outcomes, as required by section 2(6) of the Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015.

Introduction and summary

1. The National Performance Framework (NPF) is Scotland’s wellbeing framework - setting out a vision of societal wellbeing through the National Outcomes, and charting progress towards this through a range of social, environmental, and economic indicators. It has changed the way we do government in Scotland and has evolved since its inception in 2007 to a wellbeing framework with shared National Outcomes for all of Scotland.
2. A review of the National Outcomes is required by Part 1 Section 2 of the Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015. The Act states that Scottish Ministers may review the National Outcomes at any time but must begin a review before the expiry of the period of five years beginning with the date on which the National Outcomes were published. This Review was to commence no later than June 2023.
3. Work on this Review began in May 2022. The public engagement phase ran from March to June 2023. This was followed by analysis and development of the proposed changes to the National Outcomes.
4. As a result of this Review process, a series of changes to the NPF and the National Outcomes are proposed. These are:

* **New Outcomes**: Care, Climate Action, Housing.
* **Amended Outcomes**: Children and Young People, Communities, Wellbeing Economy and Fair Work, Education and Learning, Environment, Equality and Human Rights, Health, International, Reduce Poverty.
* **Unchanged Outcome**: Culture.
* **Amended extended definitions:** All of the National Outcomes have proposed changes to their extended definitions, informed by the consultation evidence. The extended definitions provide greater detail of what is covered by each National Outcome.

1. National Indicators will be revised to reflect the changes agreed with parliament to the National Outcomes.

The National Performance Framework

1. The National Performance Framework, as Scotland’s wellbeing framework, has several functions.
2. It provides a framework for collaboration and planning of policy and services across the whole spectrum of Scotland’s civic society, including public and private sectors, voluntary organisations, businesses, and communities. It is based on achieving shared outcomes that improve the quality of life for the people of Scotland.
3. In the case of public services, the NPF builds on the wider Scottish approach to reform – aligning the whole public sector around a common set of shared outcomes, supporting partnership working, collaboration and emphasising prevention.
4. The NPF is also a reporting framework that helps us understand, publicly and transparently, the progress we are making as a nation towards realising our long-term vision. The NPF supports decision-making by reporting systematically and objectively across a range of economic, social, and environmental indicators. This data helps us understand the challenges in achieving our outcomes and helps us focus policies, services, and resources on tackling those challenges.
5. The NPF is Scotland’s framework to localise the United Nations Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). Progress towards the National Outcomes is a proxy for progress towards the SDGs given the close alignment between the two.

Current landscape

1. Since the 2018 Review, a great deal has changed. The scale of the action required to tackle the climate crisis has brought environmental issues to the forefront. And the impact of the Covid-19 pandemic on every aspect of society has required a renewed focus on what we prioritise as a nation. It is in this changed policy landscape that we have reviewed the National Outcomes, and the impact of these changes is also evident in responses to the consultation.
2. The 2018 Review of the National Outcomes saw a significant repositioning of the NPF. This included making it a framework for the whole of Scotland, not just the Scottish Government, adding the values section, and simplifying the overall format and language. The revised NPF was widely lauded internationally as an ambitious framework for Scotland. Support for the current NPF has continued, with recognition from many stakeholders that it is still relevant and appropriate. This Review offers an opportunity to build upon the work of the 2018 Review, providing any necessary course correction rather than another complete overhaul.
3. The Finance and Public Administration Committee (FPAC) undertook an inquiry into the NPF, publishing their report “NPF Ambitions into Action” in October 2022. The report noted the continued value of the NPF, alongside considerations on its implementation, stating that:

It is clear to us that the NPF remains an important agreed vision of the type of place Scotland should aspire to be. As we show in this report, the NPF now needs to make more sustained progress towards achieving that vision and to ensure its ambitions are translated into action. (FPAC 2022: 6)

1. Recommendations for improving implementation of the NPF included improving accountability and the alignment of budgets to the National Outcomes. The report suggested that, overall, “a more systematic approach to implementation of the next iteration of the NPF is needed” and recommended that “the Scottish Government as part of the forthcoming review should also consult on an implementation plan, to sit alongside the final NPF, which sets out how organisations will be supported to embed the revised NPF and adopt its approach.” (FPAC 2022:12)
2. The stakeholder engagement that has taken place as part of this Review has therefore considered how to improve implementation of the NPF, as well as seeking views on the National Outcomes. Additionally, the Scottish Government has committed to working with a wide range of stakeholders throughout the development of an implementation plan that will be published alongside the reviewed NPF and to developing a Wellbeing and Sustainable Development Bill.
3. In June 2023, the Convention of Scottish Local Authorities (COSLA) and the Scottish Government agreed a new Partnership Agreement, setting out a vision for a more collaborative approach to delivering on shared priorities for the people of Scotland. This ‘Verity House Agreement’ sets out the way we will work together, how we will approach our shared priorities, and how we will engage. COSLA were co-signatories of the 2018 National Outcomes, and are key partners in working towards the National Outcomes. This approach aligns with the principles of the Verity House Agreement.
4. It is within this broader context that changes to the NPF have only been recommended where there is strong evidence that this is necessary to ensure the NPF remains as ambitious and forward looking for the coming five years, as it did in 2018.

The Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015

1. The Review of National Outcomes is being undertaken in accordance with Part 1 of the Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015. The Scottish Ministers must begin a Review of the National Outcomes before the expiry of the period of five years beginning with the date on which the National Outcomes were published.
2. The Scottish Ministers must also regularly and publicly report on progress towards these outcomes.
3. In carrying out a Review of the National Outcomes, the Scottish Ministers must consult with representatives of communities in Scotland. Following the Review they must consult the Scottish Parliament on the proposed revisions during the consultation period, for a minimum of 40 days when the Parliament is not in recess. In consulting the Scottish Parliament they must also lay before the Parliament a document describing the consultation, any representations received, and how those representations have been taken account of in preparing the proposed revisions.

The consultation process

Scale and scope

1. Building on the 2018 Review of National Outcomes, this Review primarily considered the National Outcomes. It also considered the purpose, vision, name and presentation of the NPF, and more broadly, its implementation and data.
2. In addition to the Review, the Scottish Government has committed to producing an implementation plan for the revised NPF in response to the FPAC inquiry report – “National Performance Framework: Ambitions into action”. It has also proposed introducing a Wellbeing and Sustainable Development Bill that will contain provisions to strengthen the NPF, potentially including the creation of a Future Generations Commissioner. Evidence gathered from the Review will inform these next steps.

Governance

1. A project board has provided oversight to the Review. Additionally, three advisory groups helped inform the Review process:
2. NPF Expert Advisory Group of external stakeholders with expertise in wellbeing frameworks and community engagement;
3. NPF Technical Advisory Group of Scottish Government senior analysts, chaired by the Scottish Government Chief Statistician;
4. NPF Policy Advisory Group of Scottish Government officials from various policy areas.
5. The Scottish Government Executive Team provided oversight at key milestones during the Review. Engagement with COSLA Chief Officers and Leaders also took place during the development of proposed revisions to the National Outcomes.

Process

1. The consultation and engagement phase of the Review consisted of four strands, as shown in Figure 1.

A diagram of a flower

Description automatically generated

*(Figure 1)*

Desk based research

###### Thematic gender review

1. The National Advisory Council on Women and Girls (NACWG) is a key leadership organisation in Scotland that raises awareness of gender inequality and provides advice and support to the First Minister. In 2018, the NACWG issued the following recommendation: “carry out a thematicgender review of the new National Performance Framework as a catalyst for system analysis and change.”
2. This thematic gender review consisted of a review of the data available for National Indicators that can currently be disaggregated by sex, a stakeholder meeting focused on gender and an equality impact assessment focussing on the characteristic of sex. This was supported by consideration of consultation evidence that referenced gender.
3. The gender review brought to light issues including: the importance of intersectional data to understand differing experience of the National Outcomes; the need to better mainstream gender throughout the NPF; the gendered aspects of access to safety and freedom from violence mentioned in the NPF; gendered differences in experiences of housing/homelessness and care.
4. The gender review informed the changes that are proposed to the National Outcomes, including the addition of a new Care Outcome, which recognises that the majority of caring is carried out by women and that the economic value of unpaid care should be acknowledged. The Equality and Human Rights Outcome includes promotion of gender equality and addressing discrimination and violence against women and girls. The Communities Outcome extended definition has been amended to note that different approaches may be needed to enable all groups to feel safe in public spaces. The Health Outcome extended definition now references the need to ensure those with differing health needs, such as women, have access to the healthcare they need. The Reduce Poverty Outcome recognises the link between gender and poverty.

###### Existing citizen engagement

1. There have been significant efforts made in recent years by the Scottish Government to engage with citizens in new ways, such as through citizens’ assemblies, and on key emerging policy priorities including Covid recovery and climate change. Given the depth of these engagement projects, they offer an opportunity to gather data on what matters to people in Scotland and to feed those themes directly into the Review. This has the benefit of including as many voices as possible in the Review, without risking further ‘consultation fatigue’, and maximising efficient use of resources.
2. The reports that have been considered are:

* Doing Politics Differently: Citizens’ Assembly of Scotland (2020)
* Scotland’s Climate Assembly (2021)
* From Scotland’s Young People: The Scottish Youth Parliament’s Manifesto 2021-2026 (2020)
* If not now, when?: Social Renewal Advisory Board report (2021)
* Scottish Parliament Citizens’ Panel on Covid 19 (2021)
* Covid Recovery Strategy: for a fairer future (2021)
* All Learners in Scotland Matter: National Discussion on Education (2023)

1. Different methods of engagement were used to develop these reports, and therefore the number of participants is highly variable. For example, the ‘Covid-19 Citizens Panel’ comprised of 20 individuals, whereas the ‘All Learners in Scotland Matter’ discussion included at least 38,000 people. In some cases the number of individuals involved cannot be identified. Using the data available, it is possible to say that a minimum of 44,000 people have contributed to the reports used in this part of the desk based research.

###### Commissioned research

1. In order to ensure the voices of children were included in the Review, a report was commissioned from The Children’s Parliament, which reviewed their work from 2018 to 2023 in the context of the NPF.

* What Kind of Scotland? Reviewing the National Outcomes for Scotland through the lens of Children’s Parliament’s programme of work from 2018 to 2023 report (2023)

###### Community action plans

1. A community action plan is developed with a community, identifying what a community wants to achieve, how to do so, and what resources and organisations will need to be involved to make it happen. The action plans that flow from this engagement work offer insights into the priorities for these communities.
2. The Expert Advisory Group recommended that these be considered as part of the wider engagement activity of the Review. Reviewing a range of community action plans from across Scotland, which were developed over the period 2015 – 2022, can offer a snapshot of what kind of place matters to communities. While these action plans were not intended to respond to the Review, they can offer an additional source of information on what matters to people in the communities in which they live.
3. Action plans were selected to give as wide a geographic spread as possible, across 17 local authority areas. Population estimates have been lifted directly from the plans where available. It can be assumed that a population of around 90,000 is covered within these combined action plans.
4. Community engagement took a variety of forms, both in person and online. Using available data, the plans together provide a minimum of 7,000 identified interactions with local residents and stakeholders. The actual number will be higher.
5. The action plans that were analysed for the Review are:

* Tarbert and Skipness Community Trust (Argyll and Bute)
* Menstrie (Clackmannanshire)
* Denny, Dunipace and Dennyloanhead (Falkirk
* Stratherrick and Foyers (Highland)
* St Monans and Abercrombie (Fife)
* Newmilns and Greenholm (East Ayrshire)
* Glenkens (Dumfries and Galloway)
* Harthill (North Lanarkshire)
* Forres (Moray)
* Insch (Aberdeenshire)
* Sandford and Upper Avondale (South Lanarkshire)
* Mercat Cross and City Centre (Stirling)
* Galashiels (Scottish Borders)
* Scalloway (Shetland Islands)
* Stromness (Orkney Islands)
* Greenock (Inverclyde) (Developed with the Health and Social Care Partnership)
* Auchterarder and Aberuthven (Perth and Kinross)

###### Additional documents

1. The following sources have also been reviewed for views on the implementation gap and changes to the National Outcomes or Indicators:

* [Finance and Public Administration Committee (FPAC) inquiry report](https://www.parliament.scot/-/media/files/committees/finance-and-public-administration-committee/20220512_npf_auditorgeneral.pdf)
* [Scottish Leaders Forum report on Leadership, Collective Responsibility and Delivering the National Outcomes](https://scottishleadersforum.files.wordpress.com/2022/03/leadership-collective-responsibility-and-delivering-the-national-outcomes.pdf)
* [Oxfam Scotland report on priorities and recommendations for the Scottish Parliament](https://oxfamapps.org/scotland/wp-content/uploads/2020/11/CARE-CLIMATE-AND-COVID-19-November-23-2020.pdf)
* Carnegie reports on wellbeing: [The implementation of wellbeing frameworks: What barriers are there?](https://eeac.eu/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/The-implementation-of-wellbeing-frameworks-What-barriers-are-there-by-Jennifer-Wallace.pdf#:~:text=Barriers%20%E2%80%93%20Horizontal%20tensions%20%E2%80%A2%20Wellbeing%20approaches%20require,is%20seen%20as%20a%20threat%20to%20formal%20accountability.) And [National Performance Framework Next Steps](https://carnegieuktrust.org.uk/publications/national-performance-framework-next-steps/)
* [Scotland’s International Development Alliance report on 2021-26 Policy Priorities](https://intdevalliance.scot/our-work/influencing-policy/2021-2026-policy-priorities-for-scotland/)
* [HM Government report on the UK’s Voluntary National Review of the Sustainable Development Goals](https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/uks-voluntary-national-review-of-the-sustainable-development-goals)
* [Scottish Government Report on the alignment of the NPF to the Sustainable Development Goals (SDG)](https://www.gov.scot/publications/scotland-sustainable-development-goals-national-review-drive-action/)
* Scottish Government Thematic Gender Review of the National Performance Framework (internal report – due for publication 2024)

Written consultation

1. The written consultation was hosted on the Scottish Government’s Consultation Hub and was open for responses from 14 March to 12 June 2023. The questions sought views on whether the existing National Outcomes reflect the kind of Scotland people want to see, and what changes should be made to the National Outcomes. A total of 87 valid responses were received.

Call for evidence

1. The call for evidence was also hosted on the Consultation Hub and ran for the same time period as the written consultation. Aimed primarily at organisations and stakeholders, it sought submissions on the National Outcomes and National Indicators, and how to improve implementation of the National Performance Framework. It resulted in 125 valid responses, including internal Scottish Government policy responses.

Stakeholder meetings

1. A series of 11 stakeholder meetings were held between March and June 2023 to gain further insight into key topics that had emerged through the consultation and engagement. These sessions were themed and the topics were based on existing commitments to consider changes to the National Outcomes, topics that required further discussion, or opportunities to engage with groups who expressed an interest in feeding into the Review. They followed a similar workshop format, allowing for the size and make up of each group of participants. In addition, one open session was held with no theme. Most were facilitated by the National Performance Framework Unit.
2. The themes covered by a stakeholder meeting were:

* Young people (facilitated by the Scottish Youth Parliament)
* Care
* Business
* Transport
* Housing/homelessness
* Environment (facilitated by the Economy and Environment Leadership Group)
* Sustainable Development Goals
* Gender
* Consumers (facilitated by Consumer Scotland)
* Just transition
* Open session (no specific theme)

1. The format of the workshops covered three main areas:

* What is good about the current set of National Outcomes and what should be changed
* Why does the theme matter to collective wellbeing
* How should it be reflected in the National Outcomes

1. In total, 110 stakeholders attended these sessions.

Review communications

1. Outwith the Scottish Government the consultation and call for evidence were primarily promoted via existing NPF communication and engagement channels, including:

* NPF website
* NPF newsletter (500 subscribers)
* NPF X (previously known as Twitter) account (5500 followers)
* NPF blog on the Scottish Government blogging site
* LinkedIn
* Stakeholder networks

1. People were encouraged to respond to the consultation or call for evidence, as appropriate, and to encourage their respective networks and stakeholders to respond. A communications pack was provided to support organisations to promote the Review.
2. A number of organisations held online sessions designed to inform their members and stakeholders about the Review and to encourage them to respond to the consultation or call for evidence. In some cases, these sessions were also used to gather views to inform an organisational response. The NPF Unit attended these sessions to provide an overview of the Review process and answer any questions.
3. Within the Scottish Government, existing communications channels, including the Scottish Government intranet, were used to promote the Review and to encourage colleagues to share the details with their networks and stakeholders.
4. Additionally, online engagement sessions open to all Scottish Government colleagues have been held bi-monthly throughout the Review.

Findings from the consultation

1. Thematic analysis of text-based responses was completed for all evidence received. Thematic analysis is the process of identifying patterns of meaning within qualitative data and categorising them into themes through coding. Each piece of evidence was coded through the lens of our Review question **“**Do the National Outcomes still reflect the kind of Scotland we want to see?” Final themes and sub themes were collated and categorised for consideration in the development of updated National Outcomes. In addition to this, the National Outcomes and Indicators category of themes will feed into the development of the National Indicators to support the new National Outcomes. Further detail of the analysis and results can be found in the thematic analysis summary report (Annex 3).
2. The Implementation Gap category of themes, and associated evidence, will inform the development of the implementation plan that will be published alongside the reviewed NPF, as well as policy development on the Wellbeing and Sustainable Development Bill.
3. The main themes were as follows:

|  |
| --- |
| **National Outcomes and National Indicators**   * Emerging themes with most comments * Care * Housing and Homelessness * Transport, Travel and Connectivity * Environment, Climate Change, Climate Resilience and Just Transition * Communities * Education * Economy * Health * Human Rights and Equalities   **Implementation gap**   * Emerging themes with most comments * Policy * Delivery * Funding * Legislation * Accountability * Communication and engagement   **Other**   * Emerging themes with most comments * Positive feedback * Format * Website * Feedback on the review process * Change the purpose wording * Change the name of the NPF * Language |

1. The evidence for each theme was summarised and considered for inclusion in the proposed revisions to the NPF. This evidence informed whether to include a new National Outcome, change an existing outcome, mainstream within the wider NPF, or not make a change where it did not meet the outcome criteria for inclusion in the NPF.
2. Any proposed new outcomes - or changes to existing outcomes - were expected to meet the following criteria:

* Population level theme - applies to everyone
* Contributes to wellbeing of people and planet/human flourishing
* Describes an outcome not a process
* Distinct enough from the other National Outcomes
* Improved alignment with the UN’s Sustainable Development Goals

1. Where responses were considered to be more appropriately delivered by another route, these were noted and passed to the relevant team in the Scottish Government.
2. This approach has ensured that any revisions are proportionate and informed by the evidence received.

Proposed revised National Outcomes

1. All evidence was considered, with particular emphasis on the main emerging themes. These themes have been addressed in the proposed changes to the National Outcomes as follows:

Theme - Care

1. This theme included evidence from the campaign ‘A Scotland that Cares’ led by Oxfam Scotland, Scottish Women’s Budget Group, Carers Scotland, Scottish Care and One Parent Families Scotland, and supported by over 50 organisations. The proposal to include a new National Outcome reflects the requests to acknowledge all aspects of care, paid and unpaid, for those who care and are cared for. It also responds to the findings of the thematic gender review, by increasing visibility of work that is carried out predominantly by women.

Theme - Housing and Homelessness

1. This theme included representations from housing organisations requesting a specific Housing Outcome, to underline that housing is foundational to wellbeing, through its impact on many other aspects of life. The evidence set out the importance of a secure, affordable, safe and suitable home to improving progress across other National Outcomes.

Theme - Transport, Travel and Connectivity

1. The evidence identified transport as a significant theme that should be more strongly represented across the National Outcomes. It was a frequent theme in the Community Action Plans that formed part of the desk based research, with a focus on active travel, public transport, road safety and better infrastructure. The evidence suggested that transport is a key contributor to progress towards many of the National Outcomes, rather than being an outcome in its own right. It is now represented through inclusion of ‘Connected’ in the definition of the Communities Outcome, as well as being referenced in the descriptions of Climate Action, Wellbeing Economy and Fair Work, Health and Reduce Poverty National Outcomes.

Theme - Environment, Climate Change, Climate Resilience and Just Transition

1. The evidence reflected the increased concern about climate change, mitigation and adaptation. A new standalone National Outcome has been proposed to emphasise the distinct yet interconnected climate and biodiversity crises. The addition of the Climate Action Outcome would allow the Environment Outcome to focus more strongly on the natural environment and biodiversity. This responds to the evidence that emphasised the urgency of the biodiversity crisis, and the relevance of planetary boundaries to the wellbeing economy.

Theme - Communities

1. There was considerable evidence that related to communities. This in part was due to the large number of community action plans included in the desk based research. The main issues that emerged as priorities for local communities have been reflected in the extended definition of the Communities Outcome. These include better infrastructure maintenance of community spaces and facilities as well as improved access to amenities and services, community engagement and resilience, safety, and connectedness.

Theme - Education

1. This theme was prominent in the evidence, in part due to the inclusion of the National Discussion on Education report. Some of the recurring comments covered improving inclusion and diversity within education settings, developing high-quality education professionals and shifting the focus to practical and lifelong skills development, including digital skills. The proposed changes to the Education Outcome reflects this emphasis on lifelong learning.

Theme - Economy

1. The main topics raised in the consultation evidence on economy included shifting the focus of the National Outcome towards a wellbeing economy that is sustainable, deprioritising economic growth and becoming more locally focussed. The proposed Wellbeing Economy and Fair Work Outcome recognises this in the extended definition, and emphasises wellbeing, sustainability and environmental limits as well as supporting communities.

Theme - Health

1. The strongest evidence from this theme included parity between physical and mental health within the National Outcomes, higher prioritisation and better support for mental health care, a high-quality healthcare system delivered through a fully supported and resourced NHS and recognition that healthcare is a lifelong right. The proposed change to the Health Outcome reflects the parity between mental and physical health, and the extended definition acknowledges the need for high quality health care and services.

Theme - Human Rights and Equality

1. There was a broad range of evidence that can be brought under equalities and human rights. The main themes included a dedicated equalities National Outcome, democracy, improving equality for protected groups and children’s rights. It is proposed that the existing Human Rights Outcome is amended to include equality, in response to the evidence.
2. The proposed new National Outcomes are:

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **CARE** | We are cared for as we need throughout our lives and value all those providing care |
| **CHILDREN AND YOUNG PEOPLE** | We grow up loved, safe and respected and every single one of us can realise our full potential |
| **CLIMATE ACTION** | We live sustainably, achieve a just transition to net zero and build Scotland’s resilience to climate change |
| **COMMUNITIES** | We live in communities that are connected, inclusive, empowered, resilient and safe |
| **CULTURE** | We are creative and our vibrant and diverse cultures are expressed and enjoyed widely |
| **WELLBEING ECONOMY AND FAIR WORK** | We have a competitive, entrepreneurial economy that is fair, green and growing, with thriving businesses and industry and fair work for everyone |
| **EDUCATION AND LEARNING** | We are well educated, have access to high quality learning throughout our lives and are able to contribute to society |
| **ENVIRONMENT** | We actively protect, restore, enhance and enjoy our natural environment |
| **EQUALITY AND HUMAN RIGHTS** | We respect, protect and fulfil human rights and live free from discrimination |
| **HEALTH** | We are mentally and physically healthy and active |
| **HOUSING** | We live in safe, high-quality and affordable homes that meet our needs |
| **INTERNATIONAL** | We are connected, open, show leadership and make a positive contribution globally. |
| **REDUCE POVERTY** | We tackle poverty by sharing opportunities, wealth and power more equally |

1. Each National Outcome also has an extended definition (Annex 4).
2. The proposed changes to the National Outcomes can be summarised as follows:

* **Care**. This has been added to recognise paid and unpaid care in the National Outcomes as essential aspects of social and economic wellbeing.
* **Children and Young People**. The definition of this Outcome has changed to reflect that being loved, safe and respected are positive outcomes in their own right.
* **Climate Action**. This has been added to better align with the Sustainable Development Goals and address the urgency and scale of the climate crisis which impacts wellbeing of people and planet.
* **Communities**. This Outcome has a slightly revised definition to include ‘connected’. This emphasises the important role of transport and digital connectivity to the wellbeing of communities.
* **Culture**. This Outcome has not been revised. Consultation evidence has been reflected in the long description.
* **Wellbeing Economy and Fair Work**. This Outcome brings together the former Economy and Fair Work and Business Outcomes. This streamlines the Outcomes.
* **Education and Learning**. This Outcome has been revised to emphasise the significance of all forms of learning, throughout life.
* **Environment**. The definition of this Outcome has been revised to reflect the need to proactively restore the natural environment.
* **Equality and Human Rights**. This Outcome has been revised to reference equality in the name. This improves alignment with the SDGs as well as ensuring equality has a specific focus as well as being mainstreamed through the National Outcomes.
* **Health**. The definition of this Outcome has changed to better reflect the equal significance of physical and mental health for wellbeing.
* **Housing**. This Outcome has been added as it is foundational to everyone’s wellbeing and is considered distinct from the other Outcomes.
* **International**. This Outcome’s definition has been slightly reworded to broaden the scope from a focus on the relationships between nations (‘international’) to wider environmental and social factors (‘global’).
* **Reduce Poverty**. The name of this Outcome has been changed to clarify that we are working towards a reduction in poverty.

Impact Assessments

# The National Outcomes actively seek to promote equality and to ensure equality groups have equal access to the realisation of the Outcomes. Though it will be for specific policy areas to assess the impact of any policies relating to the achieving of the National Outcomes, Impact Assessments (Equalities Impact Assessment, Island Communities Impact Assessment, Fairer Scotland Duty Assessment, Children’s Rights and Wellbeing Impact Assessment, Strategic Environmental Assessment) were carried out on the 2018 National Outcomes in order to understand any improvements that could be made in this Review, as well as on the proposed revised National Outcomes set out in this document. The evidence gathered throughout the Review was used to better understand the interests of equality groups, and these were reflected in the development of proposed revisions to the Outcomes.

Additional proposed changes to the National Performance Framework

1. As well as the National Outcomes, other aspects of the framework have also been considered as part of the Review.

Name

1. Consideration has been given to the name of the framework. Evidence was received that proposed changing the name of the NPF to ‘Scotland's Wellbeing Framework’, in order to improve clarity about the role and purpose of the framework. Consideration of the name was also recommended by the FPAC inquiry. However, there was also some concern about what a change of name could mean for the framework’s brand that has been build up since 2007, and that removing ‘performance’ could be perceived as altering the focus of the framework. Having considered this carefully, it is proposed that the existing name ‘National Performance Framework’ be retained.

Purpose

1. Based on feedback from the Review consultation and engagement it is proposed that the purpose is updated and streamlined to:

**To improve the wellbeing of people living in Scotland now and in the future**

Values

1. It is proposed that the values remain unchanged.

Alignment with the Sustainable Development Goals

1. We heard from stakeholders that alignment with the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) could be improved. We have addressed this in proposals to the revises framework in several ways.

* The new Climate Action Outcome mirrors the wording of SDG 13. This also rebalances the National Outcomes by including two Outcomes with an environmental focus. It was noted in the consultation that the SDGs have a greater number of specific environmental Goals than the NPF.
* SDG 5: Gender Equality is now more effectively represented in the National Outcomes through the addition of the Care National Outcome and explicit reference to gender equality and gender based violence in the extended definitions.
* The addition of Equalities to the Human Rights Outcome echoes SDG 10: Reduced Inequalities.
* Consideration will be given during development of the National Indicators to the consultation evidence received that suggested how to better align with the SDG indicator set.

Accessibility

1. The consultation highlighted that the NPF website and the ‘flower’ graphic are not as accessible as they could be. Accessibility will be a key consideration in the design of the revised graphic. Improvements are also being made to the NPF [website](https://www.nationalperformance.gov.scot/) to ensure it is as accessible and usable as possible for all abilities and disabilities.

Next steps

Development of indicators

1. The current set of National Indicators are set out in Annex 5. These will be revised to reflect the new National Outcomes agreed by Parliament, and will be informed by the consultation evidence.
2. Following the Review of National Outcomes, it is expected that the National Indicators that underpin them will also undergo changes. Currently we have 81 indicators in the NPF across 11 National Outcomes, of which 6 indicators are still in development (as at January 2024). We want to ensure the indicator set remains fit for purpose and focussed on measuring progress towards the updated National Outcomes. Therefore, indicator development is required to ensure the indicator set best reflects the new National Outcomes, alongside considering further data improvements from the feedback received through the National Outcomes Review consultation.
3. Work is ongoing on a revised set of National Indicators. It is being led by Scotland’s Chief Statistician, and will be completed once a revised set of National Outcomes has been agreed with Parliament. We are assessing the relevance and quality of all current 81 National Indicators as well as exploring alternative measures that would better reflect the refreshed National Outcomes. The indicators will need to meet a minimum data quality level to be included in the updated indicator set. The indicators will go through rigorous quality assurance with analysts and will be independently peer reviewed and critiqued by the NPF Technical Advisory Group (NPFTAG), which is chaired by the Chief Statistician, prior to indicators going live. Additional engagement will be undertaken with the NPF Policy Advisory Group (PAG) and NPF Expert Advisory Group (EAG). Executive Team (ET) will be briefed during indicator development to update on progress and provide an opportunity for feedback.

Implementation plan

1. The plan will primarily be informed by the evidence gathered during the Review of National Outcomes including that coded under the ‘Implementation Gap’ theme. Other relevant evidence, including that gathered during the development of the Wellbeing and Sustainable Development Bill and the FPAC report, will be considered where appropriate.
2. Project governance has been set up for the development process of the plan and the objectives and scope for the plan have been shared with the three Review advisory groups.
3. Better implementation of the NPF requires a cohesive, coordinated approach and continuous learning and improvement across the Scottish Government, the wider public sector and beyond. The implementation plan will set out a route for change and the support, ideas and energy of a wide range of stakeholders will be required to ensure its success. A collaborative approach is being taken that will seek stakeholder input throughout the development process. The NPF Expert Advisory Group have provided feedback on an early draft of the plan and will continue to shape its development.

Wellbeing and Sustainable Development Bill

1. Work is ongoing on a proposed Bill on Wellbeing and Sustainable Development to be introduced during the current parliamentary programme.
2. Building on work which has been underway since the Bill was first proposed in the 2021-2022 Programme for Government, a public consultation was held December 2023 - February 2024, including a series of engagement workshops with the public, public bodies, and third sector.
3. Following analysis of consultation responses, the team will continue to engage across the public sector both nationally and internationally to develop the contents of the Bill to best suit Scotland’s needs.

**For more information on this report please contact: Caroline Dodds (National Performance Framework Unit, Scottish Government)**

Annexes

**Annex 1:** [Summary of Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015](#Annex1)

**Annex 2**: [Children’s Parliament Report](#Annex2)

**Annex** **3:** [Consultation Analysis Summary Report](#Annex3)

**Annex 4:** [Revised National Outcomes](#Annex4)

**Annex 5**: [Current Indicators](#Annex5)

References

**Finance and Public Administration Committee**, [Report on the National Performance Framework: Ambitions into Action](https://bprcdn.parliament.scot/published/FPA/2022/10/3/a3dd32cb-f846-42db-ada6-11f7e3da9390/FPAS622R8.pdf), 2022

Annex 1: Summary of Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015

**The outcomes approach**

The Act ensures that the approach to government of having National Outcomes will continue in the long term. This means that the focus on achieving goals that improve the wellbeing and quality of life of the people of Scotland will continue. These duties do not require governments to use a particular model of purpose, targets, outcomes and indicators. They require National Outcomes to be determined, but there is flexibility as to how these may be presented and measured.

**The role of public bodies and Parliament**

“Public bodies”, and other organisations that carry out public functions such as private or third sector bodies who contribute to deliver public services, must “have regard to” the National Outcomes in carrying out their devolved functions. The Scottish Ministers and local authorities are also included. The duty does not apply to the Scottish Parliament and the Scottish Parliamentary Corporate Body.

**Developing the National Outcomes**

When setting the National Outcomes, the Scottish Ministers must have regard to the reduction of inequalities of outcomes which result from socio-economic disadvantage. They must also consult persons who appear to them to represent the interests of communities in Scotland. ‘Community’ is defined widely in the Act as including communities based on common interest, identity and geography.

**Reviewing the National Outcomes**

Once the Scottish Ministers have published the National Outcomes they must begin to review them before the expiry of 5 years from publication at a minimum. Ministers can decide how frequently within that 5 year period they wish to review the National Outcomes. In any review of the Outcomes, Scottish Ministers must consult persons who appear to represent the interests of communities in Scotland and such other persons as they consider appropriate. The Scottish Ministers may revise the National Outcomes following a review. Any review revisions must then be consulted on with the Scottish Parliament for a period of 40 days. The same 40 day provision applies in the event that no revisions are proposed after a review has taken place.

**Reporting on the National Outcomes**

Reports about the extent to which the National Outcomes have been achieved or not achieved must be prepared and published by the Scottish Ministers when they consider it appropriate. The report must include information on progress since the previous report, however, the format of the reporting will be for the Scottish Ministers to decide.

**Excerpts of the relevant statutory consultation requirements of the Act**

Section 1(5) – Consultation process

Before determining the national outcomes, the Scottish Ministers must––

(a) consult—

(i) such persons who appear to them to represent the interests of communities in Scotland, and

(ii) such other persons as they consider appropriate,

(b) having consulted the persons mentioned in paragraph (a), prepare draft national outcomes, and

(c) consult the Scottish Parliament on the draft national outcomes during the consultation period.

Section 1(6) – Consultation report and laying before the Scottish Parliament

In consulting the Scottish Parliament under paragraph (c) of subsection (5), the Scottish Ministers must also lay before the Parliament a document describing—

(a) the consultation carried out under paragraph (a) of that subsection,

(b) any representations received in response to that consultation, and

(c) whether and if so how those representations have been taken account of in preparing draft national outcomes.

Section 1(7) and (8) – publishing the outcomes and length of “consultation period”

(7) The Scottish Ministers must, no earlier than the expiry of the consultation period, publish the national outcomes.

(8) In subsections (5) and (7), “consultation period” means the period of 40 days beginning with the day on which the consultation mentioned in subsection (5)(c) commences; and in calculating the period of 40 days, no account is to be taken of any time during which the Scottish Parliament is dissolved or in recess for more than 4 days.

ANNEX 2: Children’s Parliament Report

**What kind of Scotland?**

Reviewing the National Outcomes for Scotland through the lens of Children’s Parliament’s programme of work from 2018 to 2023

Blue text on a black background

Description automatically generatedA picture containing text, bottle, sign, outdoor

Description automatically generatedApril 2023

**Contents**

[Introduction 3](#_Toc133928126)

[About Children’s Parliament 4](#_Toc133928127)

[The approach/source material 5](#_Toc133928128)

[A focus on the National Outcomes 9](#_Toc133928129)

[Education 10](#_Toc133928130)

[Communities 17](#_Toc133928131)

[Health 22](#_Toc133928132)

[Poverty 28](#_Toc133928133)

[Human Rights 32](#_Toc133928134)

[Environment 38](#_Toc133928135)

[Culture 42](#_Toc133928136)

[Economy 46](#_Toc133928137)

[International 49](#_Toc133928138)

[Children and Young People 52](#_Toc133928139)

**Introduction**

The National Performance Framework is Scotland’s wellbeing framework and sets the vision for the nation we want to be. It is also a framework that enables collaborative working to achieve our National Outcomes. These National Outcomes must be reviewed every five years, to ensure that they continue to articulate the vision and ambition we have. They help us to ask, when it comes to the experience of all our citizens, *what kind of Scotland* do we want now and for the foreseeable future?

We have come a long way in recent years with our commitment to understanding the lived experience of childhood and the respect we give to children’s participation and voice. Across government and public services there is a keen interest in engagement with children beyond the day-to-day decisions that are made. Children’s Parliament would like to acknowledge the commitment that colleagues in the Scottish Government’s National Performance Framework Unit has given to children’s participation in this and past national outcome reviews; in 2018[[1]](#footnote-1) we published our last report in support of the review process.

When we see meaningful engagement and impact, when we can report back to children that government or public bodies are listening, we make progress toward being a nation committed to human rights for all. And of course, this work now sits in the context of United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC) incorporation, with this we can expect that this good practice will become normal, customary practice for government and all public bodies.

**About Children’s Parliament**

Established in 1996, Children’s Parliament is dedicated to the realisation of children's human rights in Scotland. Our dream is that children grow up in a world of love, happiness and understanding. Our mission is to inspire greater awareness and understanding of the power of children’s human rights and to support implementation of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (UNCRC).

Children’s Parliament works with children from their early years up to the age of 14; children of this age make up approximately 16% of Scotland’s population. Through our rights-based practice we provide children with opportunities to share their views, experiences, and ideas so that they can influence positive change in their lives at home, in school and in the community.

We use creative, participatory and play-based methods to support children to meaningfully engage in decisions that affect them. We support children to influence policy, practice and legislation, and we build the capacity and win the hearts and minds of adults to realise children’s rights.

**The approach/source material**

To ensure that all aspects of wellbeing of children up to the age of 14 are considered in the National Outcomes review process, Children’s Parliament has been asked to reflect on our work since the last review of the National Outcomes was conducted.

While one of the current National Outcomes is titled *Children and Young People* it is the case that *all* National Outcomes, as much as can be expected, should have relevance in terms of the wellbeing of *all* population groups.

The review of work we have undertaken looks at 47 projects and programmes that have engaged with children between 2018 and 2023. As a result, we comment across 10 of the 11 National Outcomes as currently expressed, highlighting what we know from children’s lived experience as well as their hopes and ambitions for their own childhoods and those of future generations.

**All quotes in the document are from children, Members of Children’s Parliament (****MCPs).**

Our thanks go to the wide range of funding bodies, including Scottish Government, that have supported this work.

**Ongoing work**

Dignity in School <https://dignityinschool.childrensparliament.org.uk/>

Exploring Children’s Rights and Artificial Intelligence <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/exploring-childrens-rights-and-ai/>

Rights-based Practice in the Early Years <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/rights-based-early-years/>

Children as Human Rights Defenders programme

<https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/children-as-human-rights-defenders/>

UNCRC Skills and Knowledge Framework and Training Plan for Scotland’s workforce

<https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/uncrc-skills-knowledge-framework-training/>

Children’s Parliament Investigates Food and Health with University of St. Andrews

<https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/childrens-parliament-investigates-food-and-health/>

**2023**

Cabinet Takeover 2023 <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/cabinet-takeover-2023/>

Feelings Inspectors <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/feelings-inspectors/>

Mental Health and Wellbeing: Information and Support <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/mental-health-and-wellbeing-information-and-support/>

A consultation on the universal school milk scheme for primary schools in Scotland

<https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/universal-school-milk-scheme/>

A consultation on national school uniform Policy and Guidance

<https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/school-uniform/>

**2022**

Education Reform <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/education-reform/>

Gender Equality in Education and Learning <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/gender-equality-education-learning/>

Learning for Sustainability <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/learning-for-sustainability/>

Climate Changemakers <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/climate-changemakers/>

How Professionals Make Rights Real <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/professionals-make-rights-real/>

Falkland Imagineers <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/falkland-imagineers/>

Cabinet Takeover 2022 <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/cabinettakeover2022/>

**2021**

Children’s Parliament investigates… Child Right’s Impact Assessments <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/cria-east-lothian/>

UNCRC Incorporation consultation <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/our-work/uncrc-incorporation-consultation/>

Children’s Parliament Investigates… Mental health and Wellbeing in the Western Isles <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/mental-health-and-wellbeing-in-the-western-isles/>

Wee Ones Wee Circle <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/wee-ones-wee-circle/>

Cabinet Takeover 2021 <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/our-work/cabinettakeover-2021/>

Climate Change for the Climate Assembly [Climate change for the Climate Assembly - Children's Parliament (childrensparliament.org.uk)](https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/climate-change-for-the-climate-assembly/)

**2020**

Children and Coronavirus <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/our-work/children-and-coronavirus/>

Big Ideas Big Vote <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/the-big-ideas-big-vote/>

Children’s Parliament Investigates… Our Health and Wellbeing Curriculum <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/our-health-and-wellbeing/>

The Bramble Brae Feelings Inspectors <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/our-work/bramble-brae-feelings-inspectors/>

Imagining Aberdeen (2016 to 2020) <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/our-work/imaginingaberdeen/>

Seen and Heard Fife (2015 to 2020) <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/our-work/seenandheardfife/>

Alcohol Free Childhood <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/our-work/alcohol-free-childhood-consultation/>

Screensavers/Mind Yer Time <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/our-work/screensavers/>

**2019**

National Sitting <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/national-sitting-2019-makerightsreal/>

Scottish Learner Panel <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/our-work/past-work/learner-panel/>

What kind of Edinburgh? <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/our-work/what-kind-of-edinburgh/>

Democracy Matters (Local democracy, decision-making and power) <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/our-work/democracy-matters-consultation/>

Children as Human Rights Defenders <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/our-work/children-human-rights-defenders/>

Children Create (Studying Physical Activity in Children’s Environments across Scotland) <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/our-work/children-create/>

Manor Park Parliament <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/our-work/manor-park-parliament/>

Children’s Rights in Scotland (Action Plan for Progressing Children’s Rights in Scotland) <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/childrens-rights-in-scotland/>

**2018**

National Sitting <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/our-work/childrens-parliament-national-sitting-2018/>

Review of Part 1 of the Children Scotland Act 1995 <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/our-work/past-work/children-scotland-act-1995/>

School Food <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/our-work/past-work/school-food/>

Best Start Grant <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/our-work/past-work/best-start-grant/>

Child Poverty <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/our-work/past-work/child-poverty/>

Age of Criminal Responsibility <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/our-work/past-work/crim-resp/>

Dunkeld and Birnam A9 Project <https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/our-work/dunkeld-birnam/>

# A focus on the National Outcomes

**Education**

This national outcome is currently expressed as follows:

|  |
| --- |
| Education  **We are well educated, skilled and able to contribute to society**  We learn throughout our lives and find knowledge in varied and sometimes surprising places. Through learning we grow as individuals and as a nation, and as such, we must recognise and support excellence in teaching, research and innovation for all learners in all educational contexts. **Vision** We have an education system we can all take part in, and which inspires us to reach our potential whatever that may be. We understand that the desire to learn continues throughout life and that being curious, creative, skilled and knowledgeable is good for us, our society and economy. We value our teachers, educators and academics and do all we can to achieve the highest standards across our learning and research. We work with partners in business, industry, science and academia to ensure we lead the world in new thinking and have the talents and abilities to flourish in future. |

**Our work**

Children’s Parliament supports children to reflect on their experience of school and learning. Our flagship education programme *Dignity in School* is funded by the Gordon Cook Foundation. We place the idea of human dignity at the heart of all our work across the education system. We have engaged in the Scottish Government’s Education Reform process and published joint work with Scottish Youth Parliament and Together. We have engaged with the National Discussion that emerged as a recommendation from the report by Professor Kenneth Muir on Education Reform. Other work has reported the experience of girls in school, explored the responses to racism that are needed across the system, and addressed how our education system needs to support children in terms of learning, information and support for mental health. We also support children to reflect on life at home, also a fundamentally important setting for learning. By clearly stating a view that education is lifelong, and happening across the child’s life, then we can properly give equal value in terms of this national outcome to early years settings, school learning and home and community-based learning.

**What have children told us?**

“It is important to have someone who we trust and who can relate to us, as this helps us do our best in school.”MCP

“I’m pretty sure the government gives the teachers what we need to learn so we don’t really get a say.” MCP

“When something happens and the teacher gets mad at you, I think there should be a different way of dealing with it. We’ve talked about this with our teacher as it’s a bit shameful. You do something, he takes you out and you can see through the window that he’s shouting at you or speaking to you about something. And when you come back in, everybody is like ‘oh, what were you talking about?’ I think it should be a different way. It’s shameful. Everybody can see that you’re in trouble.” MCP

“The teacher doesn’t always see my hand.” MCP

“Racism hurts children and adults, and it happens too much today.” MCP

“I’d like the Scottish Government to put children’s rights in the curriculum in more depth.” MCP

“Learning from others is an important part of education. We do that every day, others inspire you and give you ideas – this was what was missed most during home learning, I think.” MCP

“I think we need to learn more about rights. My family told me things I never learned in school.” MCP

“We all have our own Chrome Book. We use them in lessons. Sometimes the internet is slow, and it doesn't work.” MCP

“In our healthy, happy and safe school friends would be the most important thing because without them you wouldn’t want to learn as school would be boring, like a prison. We want to change our school so there are no arguments or bullying. People would all want to play with one another.” MCP

“Children might be more excited to go to school if teachers have to respect them.” MCP

“If you go to a school that isn’t doing well and everyone knows that it makes you feel negative about going and learning. It makes you embarrassed.” MCP

* **The needs of the individual child: *being seen*.** Children tell us that they are not always seen as an individual, that their needs are not understood or met. They often feel they need to fit in to a system. Children tell us that the most important thing that impacts on wellbeing at school is positive relationships with teachers.
* **Gender Equality in Education and Learning:** Our work with girls in primary school and early secondary school has highlighted a litany of shared experiences of sexism, sexual harassment, gender-based harassment and exclusion from subjects or spaces in the school estate. While the experience of girls in this regard goes beyond the school gates, our work has identified where change needs to happen within the education system. Girls have identified the need for training for adults, that there must be both challenge and support for boys to understand and change behaviours and attitudes, for action to make all spaces within schools safe and accessed equally, for the curriculum to be reviewed with girls to identify bias and exclusion, to a need for mandated reporting and action on abuses.
* **Anti***-***racist education:** Children have the right to non-discrimination, and to education which develops respect for differences, and challenges all aspects of discrimination and prejudice. Children tell us that anti*-*racist education means support for children who experience racism and that strategies that prevent or respond to racism in school should be shaped by children of colour alongside professional people of colour. All children need to learn about how racism impacts on people. Across the educational experience of all children there should be more positive representation and learning about the achievements of people of colour.
* **Play, sport, learning outdoors and Learning for Sustainability:** Children want adults to play with them more. Children tell us they want more P.E. and opportunities to play in the school day. Children like additional after school, lunchtime, and weekend sports at school, as well as community-based opportunities. Children say that facilities in primary school need to be better. One of the positive outcomes of Covid mitigation has been increased opportunities for learning outdoors, with a reviewed focus on teaching and learning about climate and the environment. In the national outcome *Environment,* we focus more on the review of the national commitments to Learning for Sustainability.
* **Shouting and punishment:** If there is one issue that comes up repeatedly when children talk about school it is shouting. It exemplifies much of what is problematic about the ethos and experience of school; other examples might be unfair or harsh punishment, use of sarcasm or embarrassing or shaming a child, or the withdrawal of opportunities to play or take part in sport used as punishment. A common adult response when we raise the issue of shouting, or indeed these other examples, is that *it* *doesn’t happen here*. We would suggest that adults need to reflect on this, take some time to observe and listen. Or ask children. One of our Corona Times Journalists reported in 2020: “*You need to be more aware of when you are shouting. Children can do* *just fine without you being annoyed at them. So, one thing I would change is teachers making sure to put effort in being kind to the kids and not being rude for no reason”.*
* **Why are so many children not inspired by their educational experience?** As part of the Education Reform engagement with children and young people they were asked the extent to which they agreed with statement*: I am having the best possible education experience.* Only 1 in 3 secondary education students agreed. When asked to agree/disagree with the statement: *My education meets my needs as a learner*, only half agreed. Across many of the adult/professional discussions and debates about our education system a commonly heard claim, including from the OECD, is that Curriculum for Excellence *offers an inspiring and widely supported philosophy of education.* Reflecting on their experience of our education system, the views of children and young people do not support such a claim.
* **The empathic teacher is the key**. A child’s right to an education that is concerned with realising their fullest potential means getting alongside the child, valuing their lived experience, giving them love and care, and using our best professional knowledge and skills to make a positive difference. Teachers need to be, and need to be supported to be, reflective practitioners, developing the skills and confidence to be both supported and challenged by children. If Scotland is to be the best place to go to school, it needs to be the best place to be a teacher.
* **Education, expressed as teaching and learning, is a relational activity.** Rights-based relationships are based in kindness, empathy, trust and the core idea of human dignity. Further, learning is a joyful, natural, challenging and complex activity. Understanding this means that it is beholden upon us as adults, as educators, to fulfil our duty to engage the learner with dignity and respect. Children tell us that as they grow up their experience of positive, empathic relationships with teachers diminishes; these relationships are harder to find in a larger, busier secondary school environment. This, they tell us, needs to change.
* **Using technology to support learning**: The recent work led by Professor Kenneth Muir on Education Reform stated that it was a priority for the education system to consider how technology is used to support learning and assessment. We would suggest that the vision of the current national outcome is unachievable unless there is a significant review and investment in what technology is available in schools. Children tell us that even when technology is available, it might be shared across classes, oftentimes it does not work or there is poor Wi-Fi connection. Where there have been important efforts to provide children with laptops, tablets or Chromebooks these may have limited use at home when families cannot afford an internet connection. Children’s experiences of online learning or use of technology is also either enhanced or limited by the skills and confidence of the teacher.
* **Children have helped us to understand that attainment and learner voice need to be framed as human rights issues**. Scottish Government has identified the attainment gap experienced by children from our most disadvantaged communities, so recognising that there are specific and complex barriers to learning and achievement for some children. We need to understand and overcome these barriers before we can ensure their experience of school and of learning meets the minimum standards set with UNCRC incorporation. Children place a natural focus on the *experience* of being a learner, on the relationships that nurture and enable positive learner self-perception. Ability alone is not enough: how we think about ourselves matters too.  The education system is committed to extending learner participation within what is called an empowered system, yet a minority of children, as expressed to Children’s Parliament in the 2020 *How are you Doing?* surveys, agree that they have a choice in what they learn.

**Reviewing this National Outcome**

While the National Outcome *Children and Young People* refers to schools, we feel it is important that this national outcome pays more explicit attention to the parts of the education system where we find children, from early years through primary school and into secondary school and of course in community-based learning.

This National Outcome needs to articulate that, as learners, children and young people have a right to an education within a system that builds on the purposes of education defined in the UNCRC, specifically Article 29, with the purposes of education further described in the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child General Comment 1[[2]](#footnote-2). Article 29 states:

States Parties agree that the education of the child shall be directed to:

(a) The development of the child's personality, talents and mental and physical abilities to their fullest potential;

(b) The development of respect for human rights and fundamental freedoms, and for the principles enshrined in the Charter of the United Nations;

(c) The development of respect for the child's parents, his or her own cultural identity, language and values, for the national values of the country in which the child is living, the country from which he or she may originate, and for civilizations different from his or her own;

(d) The preparation of the child for responsible life in a free society, in the spirit of understanding, peace, tolerance, equality of sexes, and friendship among all peoples, ethnic, national and religious groups and persons of indigenous origin;

(e) The development of respect for the natural environment.

To be clear, ensuring our system is rights-based is not in the gift of schools or agencies that are part of the system. Following UNCRC incorporation it will be law, and all public bodies will have legal responsibilities to further the rights of the child in this regard.

This national outcome would benefit from a recognition and acknowledgement that parents and carers are the child’s first, most important and often lifelong primary educator. Education, or more accurately learning, is not just the domain of the professional educator or formal provider.

This national outcome could make clear links with the outcome that focuses on *Human Rights*. Children tell us that the experience of the education system is different if you are a girl and if you are Black/a person of colour. Our National Outcomes can be a place where we articulate our challenge to all forms of discrimination and hate.

With tackling poverty a clear policy priority this national outcome on *Education* could articulate more clearly that as a nation we will tackle barriers to education, including poverty and gender inequality, so giving more of a direct read over to other National Outcomes such as *Poverty* and *Human Rights*.

Finally, a view on the impending establishment of key new national agencies for qualifications, inspection and quality improvement, which are all part of the Education Reform process. These processes to date, and emerging descriptions of what comes next, are simply not rights based. The emerging language of ‘learner voice’ is passive and weak. It is not the transformational change promised. We would pose a question: What is the purpose of National Outcomes, sitting in a National Performance Framework, when key developments in the system fail to be grounded in the rights of the child and the aspirational vision we claim to have?

**Communities**

This national outcome is currently expressed as follows:

|  |
| --- |
| Communities  **We live in communities that are inclusive, empowered, resilient and safe**  Our communities are shaped by the quality and character of the places we live in and the people we live among. In this Outcome we recognise that to be healthy and happy as a nation we must nurture and protect our local resources, environments and all who live in them. **Vision** Our communities are pleasant places to live where everyone has a warm, appropriate, efficient and affordable home. We value excellent and innovative design and are committed to sustainable planning and transport. We believe that access to greenspace, nature and other leisure activities positively enhances our lives and health. We have high quality, affordable and accessible public services and facilities that positively enhance our lives. We focus our investment on deprived communities and disadvantaged rural areas.  We live in friendly, vibrant and cohesive communities which value diversity and support those in need. We are encouraged to volunteer, take responsibility for our community and engage with decisions about it. Our communities are resilient, safe and have low levels of crime.  Our older people are happy and fulfilled and Scotland is seen as the best place in the world to grow older. We are careful to ensure no-one is isolated, lonely or lives in poverty or poor housing. We respect the desire to live independently and provide the necessary support to do so where possible. We recognise that older people have particular needs around financial advice, mobility and transport, home improvements, heating, technology and the internet which require additional support. |

**Our work**

Children’s Parliament works with children across the domains of their lives, reflecting on home, school and community. In all areas children tell us what they and other members of their families and communities need to ensure their shared rights to be healthy, happy and safe. While children talk with us about the people and spaces that make up their community, they also talk about the services that are available. Children have helped us consider how we can use Children’s Rights Impact Assessments. How we listen to and engage with children in consideration of their communities will be an important part of how we make rights real following UNCRC incorporation.

**What have children told us?**

“Children need to live in environments that are safe and clean. Trees can help with that.” MCP

“The road is often too busy, there are a lot of cars - too many cars.” MCP

“A positive community environment is really important because families need healthy outdoor spaces.” MCP

“Pick up dog poo!!! Do it!” MCP

“Sometimes we are scared to play in the park because of broken bottles and syringes, or adults and young people drinking. When this happens, we can’t socialise with our friends.” MCP

“Adults should be kind, friendly and not shout at children and young people.” MCP

“We do not want a negative reputation depending on where we live.” MCP

“Parks should get cleaned regularly and have more bins. Walkways need more light to feel safe.” MCP

“We have technology we can use against climate change – the name of the technology is a tree!” MCP

“In the community not many children help to make decisions. Children don’t get to decide what the money is spent on, they also don’t get to vote or choose who gets to be in charge. For the very few that do have a say in making decisions they don’t enjoy it. Children are barely involved, we can make some decisions, but they are boring, and we don’t care about them.” MCP

* **Children’s concerns, aspirations and needs are often no different to adults in their community**: MCPs (Members of Children’s Parliament) from across Scotland have worked on a range of community-based reflections and formal consultations that have evidenced that their experiences and perspectives are often akin to those of adults, although their solutions to challenges can be more creative. From considerations of the dualling of the A9 in Dunkeld and Birnam, to the future of the Falkland Estate in Fife, to community/city planning in Aberdeen and Edinburgh, children often prioritise protection and active engagement with nature (whether in urban or rural settings). They are concerned with feelings of safety and effective ways to tackle bullying and violence and promote positive prosocial behaviours, a desire to tackle social isolation and to be able to play, good public transport and that every family should have ‘enough money to live on’ (this is discussed further in the national outcome *Poverty*). That perspectives are alike across the generations should be no surprise, but this can only be revealed to adults when they choose to listen and help create opportunities for children to be reflective and insightful.
* **The value of intergenerational communication and relationships:** Following on from the point above, much of our community-based work seeks to bring children and adults together, either as fellow community members or in terms of children meeting adult duty bearers from public services. It is in the interaction that learning takes place, it is our job at Children’s Parliament to prepare all parties and participants to meet with respect and good intention. This points to this national outcome needing to acknowledge more explicitly that communities of place are made up of many parts and that it is in the interaction of these parts that community cohesion is achieved. A final note on this for public bodies would be that work with communities needs adequate resourcing.
* **What would ‘public services and facilities that positively enhance our lives’ look like for children?** Or indeed for any citizen? It is interesting that this statement is found in the vision element of the national outcome, rather than read as a top line matter of lived experience. Children often tell us that things need to change now, be better now, they do not understand why so much of what they are asked about is framed as aspirational, as *vision*. So, the challenge we pose is that in our National Outcomes, and across the National Performance Framework, we should describe what public services need to be like, day-to-day, for the child or adult that engages with them. We would suggest we start with articulating the need for public services to be high quality, affordable and accessible as *the right of citizens*, understanding that rights are basic entitlements, they are (as the expression goes) *the floor not the ceiling*.
* **The value of trees:** In the national outcome *Environment* we explore in more detail what children tell us about the natural environment, but we should flag in this space the importance children give to trees. Children tell us that in every community - urban, rural or island communities – we must protect existing trees and local species, plant more, and place trees at the heart of how we curate our natural spaces. Children tell us that trees make communities healthier and happier. In their work in support of the Climate Assembly, MCPs called for the creation of a national tree planting day which would see everyone plant a tree, every year.
* **Local democracy and having a say:** In an exploration of how local democracy works and in the development of best practice toward facilitating children’s involvement in Childrens Rights Impact Assessment, Children’s Parliament has heard that there are ways to engage children: by having local Councillors come and meet children where they play, learn or hang out; by holding meetings like Community Councils in places where children and young people feel relaxed and can be invited to contribute; by involving children in participatory budgeting, giving children resources to make decisions on; by making community actions and protests safe, welcoming and inclusive of children and young people; by making participation at school work better for every child.

**Reviewing this National Outcome**

The top line text for this national outcome could be more accessible in its language and simply state: *We live in communities that are healthy, happy and safe.*

As it is, this national outcome could go further to give appropriate value and acknowledgement of the rights of those who live in geographical communities, and communities of interest, to inform and influence decisions that impact on their communities. As we journey towards being a human rights focused nation there is a need to commit to meaningful community engagement and community empowerment and to do this with citizens of all ages. The national outcome needs to talk about local democracy.

In this national outcome as well as others we would question the framing of so much of it as *vision*. As if what is stated is a dream, can only be imagined. We need our National Outcomes to be stated as basic entitlements, the rights of all citizens.

While the National Performance framework must address the lived experience and rights of older people it is odd that this group is identified in this national outcome, when their needs and rights (like children) sit across all National Outcomes.

**Health**

This national outcome is currently expressed as follows:

|  |
| --- |
| Health  **We are healthy and active**  Our NHS is pivotal to our health and happiness as a nation, and we are dedicated to supporting and equipping it to face the challenges it has now and in future. We also understand that our health is dependent on a wide variety of factors and actors, and we therefore need to take a whole system approach to promoting good health and activity. **Vision** We regard the health of all our people as being of upmost importance. Consequently, we live long, healthy and active lives regardless of where we come from. We are all able to access world class, appropriate and free/affordable health, social care and dental services. We cherish and protect the NHS as a force for good in our lives and provide the necessary investment and planning to ensure our health and social care systems are viable over the long term.  We prioritise health and wellbeing at national and local government levels and actively implement healthy public policy. We use evidence intelligently to continuously improve and challenge existing healthcare models. Our approach is integrated, preventative and person-centred. We are focused on resolving needs in order to achieve positive health, care and wellbeing outcomes.  We implement a whole system approach to health and wellbeing which targets harmful health behaviours early on and from different angles. We have revolutionised our food culture and prioritise affordable, healthy food and local food production. We have addressed the availability of unhealthy food options and are combatting food and drink industry facilitation of ill-health. We have developed a healthier, responsible attitude to smoking, alcohol and drug use. We are active and have widespread engagement with sport and exercise. Our awareness of mental health and suicide has resulted in more immediate, comprehensive and successful support for those in need. |

**Our work**

Children’s Parliament supports children to understand their right to be healthy, happy and safe, and to think about this across their lives: at home, at school and in the community. We talk a lot with children about their health and wellbeing, sometimes explicitly but inevitably whenever we play and work together aspects of health and wellbeing are a part of the conversation. Our work through the pandemic was ground-breaking in that it captured children’s lived experience, both online and the real world, using both quantitative and qualitative tools. We have also explored aspects of health and wellbeing in school life, including in terms of learning via the health and wellbeing curriculum. Exploring health also means talking about Scotland’s relationship with alcohol and tobacco. An important theme of our work in the reporting period has been around mental health and wellbeing.

**What have children told us?**

“There is a mental war going on now. Adults don’t hear about children’s mental health.” MCP

“It feels like a weight has been lifted from you when you get to talk about something that is important to you.” MCP

“If we don’t feel loved, then we can become lonely. Love is what kids need most.” MCP

“Mental health can affect your physical health, and vice versa.” MCP

“No one asks us about alcohol and suddenly when you think about it, you realise it’s all around you all the time.” MCP

“Sometimes it’s on these big boards [in shops]. It says buy 2 for £1 or something like that – it’s adverts for alcohol. Or in magazines. There’s always adverts for alcohol.” MCP

“Some children aren’t getting out to play and not as much fresh air. It’s not good for their health and happiness.” MCP

“I thought that it’d be good if teachers told their class a time of day that they could come and speak to them. Every day, it could be in the middle of lunch or something and the teacher says, ‘you can find me here and have five minutes if you need to talk to me’.” MCP

“You might be stopped from getting help when your parents, family and friends are too busy, or when you’re too scared or embarrassed to say anything.” MCP

“Make learning about mental, emotional and physical wellbeing a regular part of timetabled classes. Listen to children’s experiences and feelings through regular check-ins, talking about feelings and learning how to manage emotions. It should be like this for all children, not just when a great teacher thinks it is a good approach.” MCP

“Sometimes adults need help so they can help us eat healthily and be active and give us compliments and encourage us.” MCP

* **The impact of Covid and the meaning of recovery:** Discussion about our nation’s health is happening in the context of post pandemic recovery. Children’s Parliament has been reporting on children’s experiences since March 2020 and we continue to report on the impacts, particularly on children’s mental health and wellbeing. However, it is worth reflecting on what we mean by recovery because this impacts on how we view the future of the nation’s health. It is possible for example to think about recovery as *a return to a normal state of health, mind, or strength.* The problem with this definition is the word *normal*. In terms of health and wellbeing, particularly for some communities and populations, pre-pandemic normal was not good enough. We need to look to a more nuanced or social understanding or definition of recovery, particularly relevant when we acknowledge the levels of anxiety and other manifestations of poor mental health across our population of children and young people. Through this lens, recovery means something like *a process of change through which individuals improve their health and wellness, live a self-directed life, and strive to reach their full potential. ...Recovery is person-driven and supported through relationships and social networks*[[3]](#footnote-3). This feels like a child/person-centred and rights-based understanding of recovery as we think about health, rather than a systems-focused approach.
* **The importance of mental health/Accessing mental health information and support:** Children tell us that there are few opportunities to learn about mental health and wellbeing, this being distinct from being able to access support for mental health, which is dependent on the setting, more patchwork than pattern. In recent work Children’s Parliament has worked with children to develop a programme of learning about mental health and wellbeing to be published soon as the *Feelings Inspectors*; an innovative tool for learning and an important part of education as prevention.

In terms of children’s mental health, we learned from our work through the pandemic, and from our large scale *How are you doing?* surveys, that the mental health of children aged 8 to 14 deteriorated; this was especially so for girls aged 12 to 14. Our National Outcomes would benefit from consideration of the importance of sex as a characteristic in terms of both experiences and emerging solutions or responses.

Our work for Comhairle nan Eilean Siar/Western Isles Council explored what children seek in terms of responses to worries and to bolster good mental health. These themes were returned to when exploring, in a national project for Scottish Government/COSLA Mental Health Joint Delivery Board in 2023, what children want in terms of access to mental health information and support. If our National Outcomes are intended to foster understanding, and support action on mental health, then children need to see adults and services deliver on tackling bullying, social exclusion and loneliness, to make play spaces and opportunities available to all, to offer confidential and play based opportunities to talk about feelings, and for adults in their lives to listen and not judge.

* **Learning for and about health:** It is a noticeable omission that the national outcome does not talk about how we need to learn about health and wellbeing. Curriculum for Excellence states that all children should have access to learn about these topic areas: mental, emotional, social and physical wellbeing; physical education, physical activity and sport; food and health; relationships, sexual health and parenthood; substance misuse. With some exceptions, including some dedicated teachers and other adults in school, the Health and Wellbeing curriculum is often poorly facilitated; this becomes more serious in secondary schools where children tell us that the curriculum is more likely to be driven by subjects that are linked to exams. Children tell us that their school day must make more space and time for learning about health and that this learning must be built from positive learner/teacher relationships and an experience of being in a safe and creative learning environment.
* **An alcohol-free childhood:** Children contributed to the Scottish Government’s consultation on its Alcohol Framework 2018: Preventing Harm. The concept explored was whether children could live an alcohol-free childhood. Children told us that alcohol permeates every aspect of their lives: from marketing and availability in shops, marketing in sports and cultural spaces in real and virtual environments, exposure at family gatherings or at home, and in the streets even as they walk to school and people are outside pubs smoking. As we submit this report Scottish Government is consulting on what it intends to do about marketing of alcohol, including options that are not the ban children want to see. The current national outcome refers to “combatting food and drink industry facilitation of ill-health” and wants to see a “responsible attitude to smoking, alcohol and drug use”. If we reflect for a moment on the damage alcohol brings to childhoods, and the lifelong harm that starts with alcohol marketing to groom a future audience for these products, we can see how we need to make firmer commitments in our National Outcomes/National Performance Framework.
* **Physical activity:** The national outcome references *being active* and *support and exercise*. In our work with University of Glasgow in 2019 children tell us that children in rural areas have less access to sports facilities or organised activities; that transport to sports and leisure is a barrier to children who live in families without cars; that children with disabilities often cannot access clubs or open access facilities; that costs are increasingly becoming a barrier to participation; that outdoor play and sports areas can be poorly maintained and feel unsafe; that some children cannot afford the equipment or clothing that they require to take part, especially in winter months; that some children rely on school and out of school provision because their family does not support their participation; that girls have fewer opportunities or can feel excluded. All of this points to the need to better frame *being active* and *support and exercise* as matters of equality and inclusion.

**Reviewing this National Outcome**

This national outcome would have greater resonance with people if it were more self-evidently about people, families, communities rather than overtly about the NHS. The top line description that sits under the title feels jargonistic and does not easily speak to the public as opposed to providers. In general, this national outcome reads as somewhat disconnected from the people and communities we want to understand it.

In terms of possibly rephrasing this national outcome, our reference to how we understand what post pandemic recovery means might prove useful in rephrasing; so while not denying the importance of services and the NHS we might think about something along these lines in the body of the text: *We are a nation that seeks to support every person, young and old, to improve their health and wellness, live a self-directed life and strive to reach their full potential. Coming out of the pandemic we understand that recovery is person-driven and supported through relationships and social networks.*

One last point on the use of the word *responsible* in this outcome, used in reference to *responsible attitudes*. When *being responsible* is linked to *attitudes* then we stray into judgement and the suggestion that there is a right and a wrong way to be. Who judges this notion of being *responsible?*

**Poverty**

This national outcome is currently expressed as follows:

|  |
| --- |
| Poverty  **We tackle poverty by sharing opportunities, wealth and power more equally**  Scotland is a wealthy country, and we have the resources, ability and commitment to provide a decent life for all our people. Through this outcome we will work together across political parties and sectors to identify and address the root causes of disadvantage and set in place the actions to eradicate poverty for good. **Vision** We are committed to eradicating poverty and hunger in Scotland. We are addressing the links between poverty and income, housing, ethnicity, gender, health, disability and age. Our achievements, potential and life choices are not decided at birth or by class or background. We are all able to enjoy financial security, have a decent job, home and a good life. |

**Our work**

Children tell us about family life and about their communities. Our work during the pandemic highlighted children’s awareness of their families’ struggles with money and having enough to provide for them. With the so-called ‘cost of living’ crisis being much reported across media, children are also very aware of the challenges faced by many in the community. Children acknowledge the stigma that is associated with poverty and show great empathy to children living in poverty; they understand poverty as an infringement of rights.

**What have children told us?**

“If your parents are stressed about money and argue a lot, it’ll impact you and you feel like you can’t do anything about it.” MCP

“Children have the right to a decent standard of living. Some homes aren’t very clean because of cigarettes and alcohol. Some parents aren’t responsible because of drugs and alcohol. The Government can help massively by providing a bit extra money so children can have a better start in life.” MCP

“There is equality and there is equity – it’s hard to feel normal when you are living differently from other children.” MCP

“Nothing is truly free. You still might have to pay for the bus fare.” MCP

“My mum gives us our tea, but sometimes she doesn’t have enough money for tea.” MCP

“My mum had a job, working all the time, but now she doesn’t get as many shifts so we’re struggling at the moment.” MCP

“I think that children should be treated fairly and should always have what they need for a normal kid’s life.” MCP

“Education is free, but a lot of things are not.” MCP

“Although children have a right to food, not all children in Scotland have enough food.” MCP

“Children’s rights are the rights children have, like the right to have a good home, good food and a good community to live in.” MCP

“We went to a private school for a day recently and we got really good school lunches. It was free! You get macaroni with broccoli, and you could have fruit, ice cream and a drink too. It was delicious. I think we should all get the same opportunities to have good food at school, like private schools.” MCP

“About once a year we get one big project which we need the internet for at home. For those who don’t have it, they have to do the homework after school with the teacher.” MCP

* **Children’s awareness and understanding of poverty**: In Children’s Parliament work during the pandemic our *How are you Doing?* survey reported that 1 in 3 children said that their parents or carers worry about having enough money for their family. MCPs have chosen to take the cost of living as a key topic when they meet the Scottish Cabinet this year. Children have told us that worries about money and poverty are stresses on family life. It can be cold at home. Children cannot do the things their friends are doing. Children tell us that when their clothes are old, when they appear unkempt, they are excluded and bullied.
* **Poverty and education**: While important work has been done on the *Cost of the School Day*[[4]](#footnote-4) children still tell us about the impact of poverty on things like accessing trips and activities, school uniform, stationery and books, being left out because they can’t afford to do things with friends, being hungry and worrying about families having enough.
* **Hunger and the importance of food at school**: The national outcome currently references ending hunger. Children tell us that access to healthy food and enough to eat should be the experience of every child, it should be acknowledged as their right. For many, access to food at school, from breakfast clubs to school milk, to lunch, to snack at the after-school club, ensures they are not hungry. Although mostly appreciative of food at school it is often not of the quality or quantity children want and need, nor does it offer enough choice, it can be poorly presented or settings within which food is consumed might not be comfortable and children can be rushed.
* **Cost of living**: There is much framing of some of these issues currently as being about ‘cost of living’. Children tell us that as a nation we can do these things to address situations when families do not have enough to get by:
* Ensure children and their families have access to computers and the internet.
* Make social activities and clubs cheaper for families.
* Provide extra support for single parents.
* Reduce the price in gas, electricity and utility bills.
* Put more money towards benefits.
* Create flexible working policies for parents.
* Build more council / social housing for families.
* Provide money / support to families in need of food.
* Open more foodbanks.
* Make clubs free or cheaper so more children can attend and socialise.
* Help people keep track of what they’re spending.
* Talk with children who are living in poverty and listen to their suggestions.

**Reviewing this National Outcome**

Poverty is the greatest human rights infringement. It undermines the inherent dignity of every person touched by it. We ask Scottish Government to make this bold and clear statement in this national outcome. We suggest that the terminology of *poverty and hunger* remains as a focus, rather than the more euphemistic *cost of living*.

There is an urgent need to state as a nation we believe in *the right to food*. Only when named as a human right, for children and for adults, will we give this both a sense of urgency and some power.

**Human Rights**

This national outcome is currently expressed as follows:

|  |
| --- |
| Human Rights  **We respect, protect and fulfil human rights and live free from discrimination**  We recognise and protect the intrinsic value of all people and are a society founded on fairness, dignity, equality and respect. We demonstrate our commitment to these principles through the way we behave with and treat each other, in the rights, freedoms and protections we provide, and in the democratic, institutional and legal frameworks through which we exercise power. **Vision** We recognise the fundamental equality of all humans and strive to reflect this in our day-to-day functioning as a nation. We stand together to challenge unfairness and our equalities legislation, law and practice are world leading. We uphold human rights, democracy and the rule of law, and our justice systems are proportionate, fair and effective. We provide the care people need with love, understanding and dignity. We have robust, independent means to hold government to account and take an active interest in politics and civic life. |

**Our work**

Children’s Parliament is a human rights agency. We work with children who, when they become members of Children’s Parliament, also become Human Rights Defenders. The powerful notion of being a human rights defender[[5]](#footnote-5) helps children to connect with a global movement and to understand that they can work with others to protect and promote human rights, and that when they do, they are active agents, not passive recipients of rights.

Our work in the realm of human rights is undertaken in an exciting context: incorporation of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child into Scots law. Whilst this has experienced challenges from the UK Government and therefore delay, we believe that incorporation of United Nations Human Rights treaties into law is the only way to ensure that Scotland becomes a nation of human rights defenders.

Our work with children provides evidence that human rights realisation is about hearts and minds; by this we mean there is a need to ensure understanding, awareness and the intellectual support and commitment for human rights. There is also the need to build on the more personal and emotional pledge that this requires.

**What have children told us?**

“Children’s rights are important, very important! It’s actually a bit of care and love for you!” MCP

“Listen to children, we have good ideas.” MCP

“It’s one of your rights to know your rights.” MCP

“Children’s rights are important because they are essential to make a child’s life liveable.” MCP

“I think you should make children’s rights law because it will keep a lot more children safe.” MCP

“It’s important for children’s rights to become the law because it’s for our protection.” MCP

“I think that incorporating children’s rights is important because some people don’t even know what the UNCRC is.” MCP

“If we are talking, be quiet and listen.” MCP

“I think that if the UNCRC was incorporated fully, happiness and school performance would rise.” MCP

“Don’t shout at us. Treat us with dignity.” MCP

“Everyone should be heard, and kids also have a creative side so you may get some new ideas.” MCP

* **Putting rights in law/lessons from our UNCRC incorporation journey:** For as long as Children’s Parliament has worked with children, they have asked that their rights be put into law, and that the best way to do this would be through UNCRC incorporation.Despite unanimous Scottish Parliament support in 2021 incorporation has not yet been achieved, but in the time that is taken to resolve challenges posed by the UK Government we have been able to see where it has been possible to make progress anyway, and where the tensions are apparent. Throughout this process those supporting incorporation realise that incorporation is not a cliff edge, rather those agencies supporting the realisation of rights have been speaking about *progressive realisation*. However, with this optimistic notion in mind our sense is that progress on realisation of rights is slow, and we have concerns that in government and public services many are preparing more for complaints and litigation than they are for the cultural and behaviour change that will realise respectful rights-based relationships.

There is of course broader support for incorporation of other UN human rights treaties: the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights; the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW); the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (CERD); the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD). If this is the road we are on, then this national outcome becomes even more important to who we are as a nation. *However*, what current experiences tell us is that if we are to advance with broader human rights commitments there needs to be some deep and honest reflection about what we are learning from the process of UNCRC incorporation.

* **Where we make rights real:** The lives of children are more contained than the lives of adults; by that we mean the younger the child the more important it is to acknowledge the importance of the domain of home and the key role that early learning and childcare and then school plays in the life of the child. Children tell us day in day out about how adults at home and in care and education express love and understanding, and when they do not. It is in these spaces that we make rights real and so our national outcome needs to acknowledge these are the spaces in which rights exist or are infringed.
* **Rights in the early years:** With support from the Cattanach Trust, Children’s Parliament’s Year of Childhood in 2021 gave much focus to the Early Years Sector, namely identifying and amplifying good rights-based practice in early years settings, highlighting impact for children, families and communities. While children will have a growing understanding of rights it is often in their lived experience that our duties to protect, promote and fulfil the rights of the child will be evident. As the national outcome states: *We demonstrate our commitment to these principles through the way we behave with and treat each other*. The key challenge is how we parent or provide services which deliver on the principles, especially when the rights holders have little or no power. In this sense a national outcome has no meaning unless it relates to appropriate support, training or resources that support those with duties and power to make the principles real. Children’s Parliament has developed a 5-pillar model for the early years sector which exemplifies how this meaningful approach can be supported.
* **How professionals make rights real:** Developing the ideas already stated,the individual professional person who engages with children day-to-day is a key ally in the delivery of the experience of rights for children whether at school, within service provision, or in the community.  As the rights of the child enshrined in the UNCRC become law, Members of Children’s Parliament have investigated how professionals make rights real, producing a bank of resources, training and support materials for professionals in their lives. With UNCRC incorporation imminent, Children’s Parliament is currently a partner in the development of a Skills and Knowledge Framework and associated Training Plan for the public sector workforce. In short, the vison expressed in the National Outcomes needs to acknowledge the importance of resourcing change, so that we can develop and demonstrate rights awareness, to facilitation of rights day-to-day, to ensuring that we are a nation of rights champions and defenders.
* **Child Rights Impact Assessments:** Making rights real means understanding the potential impacts on children arising from laws, policies, budgets, programmes and services as they are being developed. CRIAs (Child Rights Impact Assessments) are recognised by the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child as general measures of implementation for the UNCRC. Members of Children’s Parliament have investigated how best to involve children in the process of Child Rights Impact Assessments. A CRIA mainstreams a human rights approach, ensuring those impacted are informed, engaged and listened to. This is especially important when the CRIA process can help identify unintended or negative impacts, or even when impacts are neutral but could be improved. What this points to is the need for decision makers and public bodies to be aware of their responsibilities and to build into the system ways of fully considering plans and decisions through the lens of children’s human rights.
* **Making participation the habit of a lifetime, while understanding that rights are about so much more.** While we appreciate the limits of what a national outcome can capture and commit us to, there is some useful learning from UNCRC incorporation that should be considered. Children’s Parliament is concerned about what can feel like an imbalance in the commitment to participation over other aspects of human rights; it can feel like there is a rush to offer or prioritise *participation* experiences to children as rights holders. At Children’s Parliament we seek to offer meaningful, safe experiences of ‘having your say’ and do so in ways so that children are inspired to make participation the habit of a lifetime, not be put off by a one-off experience. We also balance a commitment to participation rights with what are often called the other ‘Ps’: the right to *provision* or services, for example, so that health, education and play is possible; the right to *protection* from all harm; and the right to *prevention* of infringements of their rights.
* **Human Rights education and beyond…**: Children are focused on the lived experience of rights; these are experienced through rights-based relationships which are founded on kindness, empathy, trust and the core idea of human dignity. The national outcome itself is focused on the notion that “*we recognise* and protect the intrinsic value of all people” and “*we recognise* the fundamental equality of all humans…” yet there is no articulation of how this recognition comes about. We cannot assume it is intuitive and shared, indeed we know it is not because we can identify rights infringements on a daily basis. It is worth addressing the role of human rights education for all citizens. By this we do not mean rote learning of articles of a convention, rather we mean building a good knowledge base to understand what human rights ideas and principles are, which is then followed by creative, inclusive, experiential learning that builds rights awareness into the day-to-day personal and professional relationships people have.
* **Building a nation of Unfearties**: To mark Children’s Parliament’s 21st birthday, we initiated the inspiring and brave band of Unfearties. Since 2017, 1265 people, including doctors, nurses, teachers, parents, carers, civil servants, local authority workers, third sector practitioners, United Nations deputy high commissioners, and the First Minister of Scotland have joined the movement. Unfearties are individuals who are courageous in discussing children’s issues, are making a difference in children’s lives, and who are willing to speak up for, and stand alongside, children. Our national outcome currently states the need to stand together and uphold rights, our contribution regarding *Unfeartieness* is to try to encapsulate our distinctive Scottish spin on the idea of human rights defenders. We offer the idea to others and would love to see it reflected in our National Outcomes.

**Reviewing this National Outcome**

During our work through 2020, in the context of the pandemic, children were asked whether they felt that their rights were respected by others; 25% of children responded *‘no’*. This being so, the national outcome would be strengthened by stating that our vision requires commitment to UNCRC incorporation as well as to the other human rights treaties as part of a Scottish Human Rights Bill. Only when rights are enshrined in law are they fully able to protect all citizens.

Equally, the national outcome needs to express an understanding and commitment to make rights real for all in the public and private domains of life; in terms of children, rights do not end, nor are they compromised, when the child goes home, or goes to school.

This national outcome could helpfully articulate an understanding of the ideas of *rights holders* and *duty bearers*. Rights holders are not passive recipients, nor are human rights in the gift of duty bearers. For our nation to understand the power and meaning of human rights the national outcome must clearly state that human rights are universal, indivisible, interdependent and interrelated.

The national outcome could explicitly prompt public bodies to reflect on and take action to ensure that their practices are world leading. The National Outcomes states that: *We have robust, independent means to hold government to account..*. One important way to do this is to have meaningful human rights Impact Assessments of all laws, policies, budgets, programmes and services as they are being developed.

There is one final challenge with this national outcome: it's very offer as a distinct item. One challenge of supporting the process of implementing the rights of the child has been to help adults/services understand that human rights are not another initiative, rather they are a foundation. A choice needs to be made: do we articulate human rights as a distinct national outcome, or do we ensure than human rights commitments and language and culture permeate every other stated national outcome?

**Environment**

This national outcome is currently expressed as follows:

|  |
| --- |
| Environment  **We value, enjoy, protect and enhance our environment**  Scotland is a beautiful country, and we are blessed with abundant natural resources and architecture to rival the best in the world. Through this Outcome we recognise that it is our duty to protect and enhance these assets as essential to our economy, culture, way of life and the wellbeing of future generations. **Vision** We see our natural landscape and wilderness as essential to our identity and way of life. We take a bold approach to enhancing and protecting our natural assets and heritage. We ensure all communities can engage with and benefit from nature and green space. We live in clean and unpolluted environments and aspire to being the greenest country in the world.  We are committed to environmental justice and preserving planetary resources for future generations. We consume and use our resources wisely, ethically and effectively and have an advanced recycling culture. We are at the forefront of carbon reduction efforts, renewable energy, sustainable technologies and biodiversity practice. We promote high quality, sustainable planning, design and housing. Our transport infrastructure is integrated, sustainable, efficient and reliable. We promote active travel, cycling and walking, and discourage car reliance and use particularly in towns and cities. |

**Our work**

Children’s Parliament has long focused on exploring with children where they live. This might start with their home, their street and neighbourhood. Then it extends to their village or town, the island or region they live in and their country. We also think of where we live as the planet we share. This area of work has been very busy in the period we consider in this report. With Scotland at the centre of global initiatives with COP26 the interest and opportunities children had to learn about and explore the environment and the climate emergency grew massively. Children’s Parliament was delighted to be at the heart of much of this work, bringing children’s voices to considerations here and internationally. We hope the response to this national outcome draws attention to the need to place children's rights and wellbeing at the heart of what we want now and in the future.

**What have children told us?**

“We love learning about our environment.” MCP

“Outdoor learning is sometimes just one week in the school year, it should be in every subject.” MCP

“If COP26 hadn’t happened, we wouldn’t have learned about global warming.” MCP

“Adults in Scottish Government and teachers should have climate education for them planned into every school year.” MCP

“There should be more time to be active and play. They are good for your health, give you more opportunities, teach you how to respect other people and learn communication skills.” MCP

“We don’t do enough about the environment at school.” MCP

“We should have solar panels and do more recycling at school.” MCP

“As it will affect our future, we need to know what is going on now.” MCP

“We didn’t even recycle in our school, like not at all, we didn’t even have recycling bins. So we petitioned the school to get recycling bins and we were successful, but the school wasn’t responsible for emptying them, it was the local council because they had some like contract or something with a cleaning company, and anyways they ended up not collecting the recycling bins when they were supposed to and they just overflowed and eventually got locked up and then taken away. Our school tried to help but it was the council’s decision, and they couldn’t do anything about it.” MCP

“We learn about climate change in school, and it is interesting, but sometimes I start to not care because I don’t know what to do about it.” MCP

“Learning about climate change is important to me because I want to feel safe and make sure that the planet works and stays sustainable.” MCP

“Through being involved in the Climate Assembly and other events with adult decision makers on the climate emergency, I've noticed that other adults around me at school and at home have been inspired by our work. They've changed their attitudes and perspectives on climate change in one year.” MCP

* **Childhood and the climate emergency:** Children are citizens now, and across the globe they are impacted by the climate crisis. Children tell us that it is imperative that we take action to tackle the climate crisis at home and in alliance with others. There is a sense of urgency in what children tell us; this challenges the notion that it is *the future* rather than *the now* that concerns or impacts on them.
* **Opportunities arising from COP26:** Children tell us that COP26 inspired many educators and schools to introduce children to learning about climate and sustainability. In doing so, and in seeing Scotland at the heart of a global event, this made children feel inspired to learn and do more. It remains to be seen whether COP26 has been a springboard or a one-off event in terms of learning in our schools.
* **The value of engaging children as partners in our response to the climate emergency**: Children’s Parliament was delighted to be able to support MCPs to be part of Scotland’s 2021 Climate Assembly. Adult Assembly members were respectful and inclusive of children’s perspectives and the calls to action they offered; this was a genuinely impressive example of children’s participation on both process and outcomes. Children’s Calls to Action are detailed in the full report, (link provided earlier in the sources section), but it is worth highlighting overarching themes here which were: *diet and food* and the changes that are required; *land and sea use* which considered farming, trees and protecting wildlife and native species; *our lifestyle* which considered house building and homes, reusing and recycling and support for those struggling to heat and pay bills at home; *how we travel* which thought about electric cars, getting to school, cycling and public transport; *work and learning* which reflected on more green sector jobs, better learning about things we can all do that will help tackle the climate emergency. Our MCPs also brought international connection and recognition, for example taking their work to Mikiko Otani, Chair of the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child. She continues to take the children's messages across a range of international fora.
* **Learning about and for sustainability:** This national outcome does not yet recognise the importance of education for *all* citizens when it comes to how we look after the natural environment or understand and then act on the climate. Theoretically, all children in Scotland’s schools have access to the part of the curriculum that is called Learning for Sustainability which covers several distinct but interrelated areas: outdoor learning, global citizenship and learning about sustainable development and the climate emergency. We say theoretically because children tell us that access to this curriculum is something of a lottery, dependent on whether adults in the education system want to give access to it. During Covid and post pandemic children tell us there was increased opportunity for outdoor learning, but this was pragmatic rather than considered as part of the Learning for Sustainability offer. As stated above, many children tell us they had improved experiences of learning about sustainable development and the climate emergency because of a connection with COP26. When it comes to global citizenship children tell us they do ‘rights education’, oftentimes considering rights infringement experienced by children globally, but they do not necessarily learn about or experience rights day-to-day. Children tell us they want outdoor learning to be part of the day-to-day offer of the school day, and not just in early learning or primary school but in secondary school too. Children tell us they want to do more to learn about and act on children’s human rights, climate emergency and sustainability; and they want to do this with adults alongside them.

**Reviewing this National Outcome**

The national outcome could make clear the need for education for all citizens, and commit our nation to ensuring learning for every child about the climate crisis within the curricular area Learning for Sustainability.

In the description of the calls to action from the children involved in the Climate Assembly we see that their interests are reflected in the national outcome. It would be helpful to simplify language and ensure that each of the children’s key areas are described explicitly: *diet and food*, *land and sea use*, *our lifestyle*, *how we travel* and *work and learning.*

Children are intuitively international in their perspective, and they very much believe that environmental issues are often global issues. This national outcome might benefit from an acknowledgment that what we do here in Scotland must connect with global initiatives.

**Culture**

This national outcome is currently expressed as follows:

|  |
| --- |
| Culture  **We are creative and our vibrant and diverse cultures are expressed and enjoyed widely**  Scotland is a vibrant, modern country with a strong tradition of investment in the arts and creativity. We have world renowned festivals, music and film industries and a rich seam of storytelling and visual art which stretches back hundreds of years. In this Outcome we honour, celebrate and support our creative talent in all its wonderful diversity. **Vision** We take pride in being a vibrant and creative country. We see our culture, humour and heritage as essential to who we are and to our appeal as a place to live and visit. We recognise that the arts and culture bring us pleasure as well as other social and economic benefits. We cherish and protect our history, traditional and rural cultures, and embrace those from elsewhere. Everyone is encouraged to enjoy culture in all its forms, and we support our creative sectors and those working in them. |

**Our work**

Children’s Parliament uses the arts and creative approaches as a medium for our engagement with children. When observing a Children’s Parliament session, one might see children engaged in puppetry, sculpture, drama, photography or creating animations. We do this because creativity provides simple pleasure. Much like play, these arts activities are natural for the child, they facilitate expression and overcome other barriers to participation and traditional thoughts about what ‘voice’ means.

In feedback here we draw on our work as part of the Education Reform process to report on what children tell us. We also consider the importance of Article 31 of the UNCRC when we reflect on arts and creativity.

**What have children told us?**

“School doesn’t help your talent. It only helps with literacy and numeracy.” MCP

“Some people who like sport in PE show their personality, and who like writing also show their personality. But those who like drawing, dancing, singing, only get to show personality at break.” MCP

“I am more creative at home.” MCP

“I am half French so being able to teach French in my class helps to celebrate my differences. It really teaches you how to respect people. The school supports my special way of communicating.” MCP

“When we learn about our culture, it makes us feel proud to be Scottish.” MCP

“We learn Gaelic from P1, and we use it in lots of projects like local archaeological digs or bingo or community cafes. We have a Gaelic choir in school and take part in the national Mod. We do lots of learning about the history and culture of our Island…” MCP

“Respect is in our school values, and we do religious learning, but I feel that we focus too much on Christian festivals.” MCP

“Children from Poland and England do not feel represented. I would like to learn more about these.” MCP

“I don’t know what the values of Scotland are.” MCP

* **Creativity at school**: As part of our work on the process of Education Reform we asked children to reflect on the statement:*My education helps me to develop my personality, talents and abilities to their fullest potential*. Just over half of the 3,879 secondary school learners who responded agreed with the statement (56%). In small group discussion children identified that the school curriculum often focuses on more traditional academic subjects and there is a lack of space for arts and creativity.
* **Cultural identity and language**: The Education Reform work also saw us ask children for responses to this statement: *My education helps me to develop respect for my parents/carers, my cultural identity and language.* Secondary school learners responded to a survey, and just over half of the 3,868 who responded agreed with the statement (55%). Using small group discussion to feed back their views children in primary school reported that they do project work to learn about different cultures and faiths. Some also develop ideas about cultural identity through traditional dance and poetry. Those learning in Gaelic medium education learn about their language and culture. But experiences differ, and some children do not feel that their culture or faith is equally acknowledged or respected.

Children also reported that they want to learn more about other cultures, and to see a more diverse representation of adults who work in schools as teachers and in other roles.

* **What are the national values of Scotland?** The Education Reform work also saw us ask children for responses to this statement: *My education helps me to develop respect for the national values of Scotland.* As with the earlier statements this is asked because it is stated in Article 29 of the UNCRC as one of the purposes of education.Many of the responses from primary and secondary school age children were that they simply did not know what our national values are: indeed, some asked, *do we have any?* Secondary school learners responded to a survey, and fewer than half of the 3,858 responders agreed with the statement (44%).

**Reviewing this National Outcome**

While this national outcome is about arts and creativity it is overly focused on this as a ‘sector’ or an industry rather than how, as the UNCRC states, we are committed as a nation to *the development of the child’s personality, talents and abilities to their fullest potential*.

It is unclear what the National Outcomes means by *culture* beyond the arts sector. Do we also mean *culture* in the sense of the customs and social behaviours of our society? If we do, then we would want to see this national outcome connect with the cultural, lived experience of children: Are they seen? Are they heard?

Further, is it more helpful to express access to the arts as a right? Specifically, this national outcome must surely connect with Article 31 of the UNCRC, which will soon be in Scots law:

### **Article 31**

1. States Parties recognize the right of the child to rest and leisure, to engage in play and recreational activities appropriate to the age of the child and to participate freely in cultural life and the arts.

2. States Parties shall respect and promote the right of the child to participate fully in cultural and artistic life and shall encourage the provision of appropriate and equal opportunities for cultural, artistic, recreational and leisure activity.

And finally, should a national outcome on *culture* be more explicitly concerned with articulating our national values?

**Economy**

This national outcome is currently expressed as follows:

|  |
| --- |
| Economy  **We have a globally competitive, entrepreneurial, inclusive and sustainable economy**  We recognise that a strong, competitive economy is essential to supporting jobs, incomes and our quality of life. We also know that our economy must be environmentally sustainable, inclusive and benefit all our people and communities. Through this Outcome we will create the conditions through which to achieve these commitments alongside economic growth. **Vision** We have a strong, dynamic and productive economy which creates wealth and employment across Scotland. Our economy is competitive, and we have good international trade, investment and export networks. We are considered an attractive place to do business.  Our economy is inclusive and focused on improving the lives of all our people. We ensure the benefits of economic growth, wealth and opportunities are fairly shared. Access to labour markets and jobs is evenly shared between us. Our sustainable economic growth is not achieved at the expense of our social interests or those of the environment. As such, our economy is ecologically accountable as well as socially responsible. We regard the green economy and our rich ecological capital as a valuable development opportunity and actively progress advancements in these areas. |

**Our work**

When Members of Children’s Parliament talk about the economy they talk about people, how they live their lives, what they can do, and be. In work exploring the climate, sustainability and poverty children tell us how as a society we should be, one that is fair and green. There is a clear cross over with this national outcome and the reporting we provide on National Outcomes entitled *Poverty* and *Environment*.

**What have children told us?**

“Every family should have enough money to live on.” MCP

“I think you should move poverty up as a priority because it’s becoming more likely to happen.” MCP

“Parents should be there for their children, but they need to work too. It would be really difficult for some families to do both, but they have to be there for their children either way.” MCP

“Fairness means everyone gets the same opportunity.” MCP

“People in poverty might be scared to ask for help or go to a foodbank because they don’t want to look weak. They want to be seen as strong.” MCP

“Buy locally sourced produce, recycle and speak about how we feel about climate change.” MCP

“Governments around the world are trying to make money, but these methods may involve changing the environment and destroying the livelihoods of people of poorer nations. These poorer people may have no say in these changes.” MCP

* **What is the focus of our thinking and action when it comes to the economy?** The national outcome proposes that a key purpose of the economy is that we *create wealth and employment*. While there is acknowledgement of the importance of *inclusion and sustainability* children tell us they want an economy that is more explicitly concerned with eradicating poverty, addresses the climate emergency and is committed to global justice.
* **Children intuitively seek an economy that works for people**. Across our programmes children suggest ways to do this that might inform the National Outcomes and National Performance Framework:
  + Create more jobs that help look after nature.
  + Help people who don’t have jobs to learn skills and get green jobs (green jobs look after the environment and tackle the climate crisis).
  + Teach children about green jobs and what qualifications they need to get them.
  + Shorten the hours people are at work or school so they can do things like grow their own food, plant trees and look after and repair things in their area.
  + Make and sell more food locally.
  + Support environmentally friendly small businesses, organic farmers and butchers.
  + Allow only sustainable ways of farming, fishing and crofting.
  + Use only natural fertilisers and reduce the number of animals being farmed or fished.
  + Only build new homes where this doesn’t damage important or protected habitats, and make sure all new houses are energy efficient.
  + Create more wind farms and solar panel use so that all energy in Scotland is renewable.
  + Make businesses pay for their waste and impact on the environment.
  + Create better railways to help connect people.
  + Make public transport better and more environmentally friendly.
  + Ban diesel and petrol cars and make electric cars affordable.

**Reviewing this National Outcome**

Children tell us that there are many things that we can do that will support our economy to be fairer, inclusive of all and more environmentally friendly and sustainable. The national outcome could articulate the connections more clearly with efforts to do our best when it comes to the climate crisis and eradicating poverty.

**International**

This national outcome is currently expressed as follows:

|  |
| --- |
| International  **We are open, connected and make a positive contribution internationally**  Scotland has a long and proud history of intellectual, cultural and economic exchange. As we have carried our stories, talents and creations abroad so too we have welcomed and benefited from those of others. In this Outcome we commit to fulfilling our obligations internationally, promoting our place in the world and deepening our relationships with others. **Vision** We pursue happiness and quality of life as legitimate social goals. Our family, communities and people are important to us, and we are committed to being fair and socially just. We are respectful of all who chose to visit, live and work in Scotland and acknowledge the positive contribution they make. Our visitor economy is thriving.  We are proud of our achievements and are confident, ambitious and positive about the future. We are regarded as a vibrant, modern country and have positive international relations, influence and exchange networks. We recognise the inter-connectedness of people and the obligations which flow from this and play a valuable role in providing aid and supporting developing countries. We are committed to promoting peace, democracy and human rights globally. |

**Our work**

Children’s Parliament is focused on the realisation of children’s human rights here in Scotland, but the UNCRC is of course the most widely ratified of all human rights treaties. The realisation of children’s human rights is an international endeavour. When Scotland completes the process of UNCRC incorporation into law this will place us in a small but growing band of nations that have taken the step beyond simple ratification. Scotland is the only country in the UK to have done so. In our work we support children to think internationally and globally. Some of our work demands this perspective, for example children’s engagement with the climate crisis which is discussed in an earlier national outcome: *Environment*.

**What have children told us?**

“Please make people follow children’s rights better and make an effort to enforce them in Scotland. Then we will inspire other nations to do the same.” MCP

“If a country has really good results in play, it would be amazing if every country could learn and take from the one that is doing well and then every country would be amazing.” MCP

* **Children at the United Nations:** In 2018 Members of Children’s Parliament took part in the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child ‘Children as Human Rights Defenders’  Day of General Discussion (DGD)[[6]](#footnote-6).

Members of Children’s Parliament have also engaged with the UNCRC reporting process and attended the UN Committee on the Rights of the Child which meets in Geneva, representing the views and lived experience of Scotland’s children during the Committee’s consideration of the UK/Scotland reports on UNCRC implementation. In 2023 they took several key issues, distilled and agreed with MCPs from across the country from our programme of work. They presented on the experience of school, pressures of testing, the importance of positive relationships and ideas about how human dignity should be embedded in the experience of school and learning. They also discussed equality, focusing on racism and the experiences of girls in the education system, they talked about mental health and wellbeing, presenting on the importance of children accessing information and support, that learning about mental health should be improved, and the value of activities, play and positive relationships. They shared views on the vital role that adults play to make rights real for children, identifying that adults need to model rights-based relationships and include children in decisions.

* **Other international connections:** The realisation of children’s human rights is a global endeavour. In support, Children’s Parliament is a partner in the International and Canadian Child Rights Programme[[7]](#footnote-7). Working in an international alliance the work will explore and better understand the connection between children’s rights to participation and protection.

**Reviewing this National Outcome**

This national outcome could do more to acknowledge that every citizen, including children, can contribute to creating a nation that is outward facing, internationalist and committed to social justice. Being part of a global family that seeks to make rights real for children we would suggest that this national outcome needs to make more of the phrase which closes the current text, this would mean putting these words front and centre in our national outcome: *We are committed to promoting peace, democracy and human rights globally.*

## **Children and Young People**

This national outcome is currently expressed as follows:

|  |
| --- |
| Children and Young People  **We grow up loved, safe and respected so that we realise our full potential**  In our children we see the best and worst of ourselves now and in the future. They are the measure of our worth as a nation. In this Outcome we are dedicated to providing the essential conditions of love, respect and understanding through which our children can become the happy, fulfilled and successful adults they all have a right to be. **Vision** We do all we can to ensure our children grow up in an atmosphere of happiness, love and understanding. We enhance their life chances through our early years provision and by supporting families when they need it. We ensure childhood is free from abuse, tobacco, alcohol, drugs, poverty and hunger. Our children are not left worried or isolated. We include and involve children in decisions about their lives and world, and protect their rights, dignity and wellbeing.  Our communities are safe places where children are valued, nurtured and treated with kindness. We provide stimulating activities and encourage children to engage positively with the built and natural environment and to play their part in its care. We provide the conditions in which all children can be healthy and active. Our schools are loving, respectful and encouraging places where everyone can learn, play and flourish. We provide children and young people with hope for the future and create opportunities for them to fulfil their dreams. |

**Our work**

Children’s Parliament provides a rights-based lens through which our nation can see and understand childhood. We are not the only agency who helps in this regard, but we are uniquely placed as everything is founded and grounded in the human rights of children. This report began with a plea to weave childhood and children’s human rights throughout all National Outcomes, but we also appreciate that a distinct national outcome also focuses the mind on a special realm, when so much is learned and internalised and informs the adults we become. We ask that you do not misunderstand this point, children are not to be perceived only in terms of *becoming*, they are citizens now. If this distinct national outcome is to achieve anything it needs to be the place where children and young people are firmly located as actors in Scotland’s drive for wellbeing, now as well as in the future.

Feedback on this national outcome highlights some specific issues in terms of what we have learned from children across our programmes.

**What have children told us?**

“We need your encouragement. If you are told comments like ‘you are never going to get where you want’, then you feel like you can’t do it. Be positive and support us to get better at things.” MCP

“Not being part of decision- making about my life makes me angry and sad.” MCP

“Bullying makes children feel horrible, abandoned and left alone. You feel like no-one ever cares for you.” MCP

“Sometimes when you say something and adults don’t believe you that makes you feel sad; that they are not being kind and that’s when sometimes if they don’t trust me, I don’t really trust them.” MCP

“I think adults should protect children from harm, they should be protective shields and keep children safe.” MCP

“It is important that children with care experience think they are loved. Even if they are cared for - they all have the right to be loved.” MCP

“Adults have to find the space in their day to stop and listen to us.” MCP

“Adults may say that it is just a joke and that the child that is being bullied is just overreacting and taking it too seriously, but they aren’t.” MCP

“Something bad is that parents aren’t nice to their children – they shout at them and hurt them, not just their feelings but their bodies too, then the child is really sad.” MCP

“If you go online and you see somebody, you might think they have the perfect life. They’re only going to post the good stuff, but it makes you feel bad about yourself as you think ‘wow, they’re so much better than me’.” MCP

“Never hide the fact that someone is bullying you. Cyber bullying hurts. It really hurts. It doesn’t end well for anyone.” MCP

“When you have someone who loves you like that around you, you don’t feel all alone and helpless, like some random being in the world.” MCP

“We listen to adults because they’re our bosses apparently, but this is my life, and I should be the boss of myself.” MCP

“Please try to keep social workers with children as long as possible and don’t change them around. You can’t build trusting relationships if you know they will be leaving you again soon.” MCP

“I really want to stay with my foster carer, she’s really nice. I can’t tell my social worker because I’m frightened they’ll tell my mum. When she gives me a bit of paper and asks what I want, I just say ‘I don’t know’.” MCP

* **Bullying:** Children have been telling Children’s Parliament for nearly 30 years that bullying is a serious rights infringement that adults continue to fail to prevent or respond to adequately. This national outcome would benefit from some extended language around abuse: we would suggest in parenthesis after the word *abuse* it should read: *Abuse can be physical, sexual, neglect or bullying*.
* **Loneliness, worries and connectedness:** Currently, the national outcome expresses this vision: *Our children are not left worried or isolated*. Across 2020 children told us that they often felt lonely. We understand this was in the context of lockdowns, but coming out of these experiences later in the year we were still being told by 1 in 5 children that they often feel lonely. Again, after their experiences of Covid by late 2020 around 35% of boys and 45% of girls between 8 and 14 years old were responding negatively to the prompt ‘even if I am having a difficult time, I feel I will be okay’. Alongside this 20% of children told us if they had a question about their health, they did not know who to speak to. Most concerning was that by late 2020, 50% of 12 to 14-year-old girls, 32% of 12 to 14-year-old boys and 35% of 8 to 11-year-old girls and boys agreed with the prompt statement ‘*There are lots of things I worry about in my life*’.

As adults we often imagine childhood as carefree, a sociable time when friendships and connection with adults is to be expected. It is important that this national outcome has a positive vision that *our children* *are not left worried or isolated*, but making the statement alone does not make it so.

* **Care experienced children:** Members of Children’s Parliament with care experience were supported to contribute to the work undertaken as part of the Care Review that led to The Promise. Children tell us that when they are in the care system then love should be at the heart of all relationships and experiences. Relationships are essential to build trust and help recovery from trauma. Children tell us that respite is challenging for children and should only be used in emergency situations. Children who are care experienced tell us they need to have adequate support for learning and as many opportunities to succeed as possible. They tell us they need to feel like they belong with the families they live with, whether in kinship or foster care, and want to be treated like the other children in the family. Policies and practices which make children feel excluded from ‘normal’ life should be stopped.
* **Living lives that are both ‘real world’ and virtual:** The digital world offers extraordinary opportunities for promoting and protecting children’s rights and wellbeing. Children tell us that they do not necessarily distinguish between the two spaces, they can move easily from real to online environments for learning, play, relationships and information. Work has been undertaken by Children’s Parliament and other agencies working with children and young people to explore how to be healthy, happy and safe online but perhaps this national outcome needs to acknowledge the different lived experience of this generation of younger citizens. This is more than online safety; this is about citizens living lives across platforms.

**Reviewing this National Outcome**

This national outcome requires a significant amount of change. We will address it section by section.

The outcome starts with this statement: *In our children we see the best and worst of ourselves now and in the future*. We struggle to understand what this means and suggest this is deleted in the review.

It continues: *They are the measure of our worth as a nation*. Again, this is unclear. Does it mean we measure our success as a nation in terms of how children report whether their childhood is a good childhood? We do not measure this at the moment. Again, a plea to delete this from the review of the outcome.

It continues: *In this Outcome we* *are dedicated to providing the essential conditions of love, respect and understanding through which our children can become the happy, fulfilled and successful adults they all have a right to be*. It would help if we reviewed and refocused the language in reference to children, lifting from the UNCRC more clearly and so consistently using the language of the Convention, for example we could use language like this:

* As a nation we recognise the inherent dignity and equal and inalienable rights of all members of the human family, which of course includes children and young people.
* We acknowledge that there are children living in exceptionally difficult conditions, and that such children need special consideration.
* Our commitment to the rights of the child means we reaffirm our faith in fundamental human rights and dignity and the worth of all children and young people.
* All children and young people are entitled to all rights and freedoms without distinction of any kind, such as race, colour, sex, language, religion, political or other opinion, national or social origin, property, birth or other status.
* We understand that the child, by reason of their physical and mental immaturity, needs special safeguards and care, including appropriate legal protection, before as well as after birth.
* We recognise that the family is the fundamental group of society and the natural environment for the growth and well-being of all its members and particularly children.
* We are committed to a childhood for every child that fully prepares them to live an individual life in society, brought up in the spirit of the ideals proclaimed in the Charter of the United Nations, and in the spirit of peace, dignity, tolerance, freedom, equality and solidarity.

In the vision element of the current national outcome the language is good and appropriate, but as we have referenced elsewhere the issue is that the term ‘*vision*’ implies some point in the future. Rather, what is described needs to be the reality, lived day-to-day experience of children and young people *now*, particularly so in the context of UNCRC incorporation. If we are not yet providing children with safe, stimulating, healthy, respectful, playful, fulfilling (all the language in the outcome) spaces and relationships, we are failing them.

To summarise, this national outcome needs to align itself with the UNCRC as impending Scots law; incorporation means something very profound in terms of how we view childhood and how we work together to realise children’s human rights and wellbeing.

Finally, when it comes to one group of children - those who are care experienced - there is a real imperative to acknowledge that children want to be involved in making decisions about their lives. As well as reviewing and framing this national outcome in the rights of the child, this outcome needs to make specific reference to the commitments made to care experienced children and young people as part of The Promise. We understand that National Outcomes may not be the place to list policy, but The Promise talks to the nation we are, and it should be made explicit in our National Outcomes.

Annex 3: Consultation Analysis Summary Report

###### Executive Summary

The statutory Review of the National Outcomes seeks to answer the question “Do the National Outcomes still reflect the kind of Scotland we want to see?” and to collect evidence on gaps within the implementation of the National Outcomes across Scotland, referred to as the “implementation gap”.

We answered the review question by collecting and analysing evidence from four evidence strands: desk-based research (covering 34 sources), a public written consultation (87 responses), a stakeholder call for evidence (125 responses) and expert stakeholder meetings (110 stakeholders attending 11 meetings).

Thematic analysis of text-based responses was completed manually. Each piece of evidence was analysed and coded through the lens of our review question **“**Do the National Outcomes still reflect the kind of Scotland we want to see?”

The final themes and sub-themes were split into three categories for distribution and further use:

1. National Outcomes and Indicators (4,809 comments covering 78 themes)
2. Implementation Gap (874 comments covering 11 themes)
3. Other (345 comments covering 12 themes)

Analysis showed that views were diverse, with over 5,000 comments categorised into more than 100 themes and 800 sub-themes. Although the NPF generally provides a useful high-level vision with good comprehensive coverage of key issues, there are gaps and areas which could be strengthened to better reflect the kind of Scotland we want to see. Key themes which are underrepresented within the current National Outcomes include: recognising the importance of care, good quality transport and housing, shifting focus towards a wellbeing economy, reducing inequalities, improving mental health, and prioritising climate action to combat climate change.

Analysis of evidence on the implementation gap of the National Outcomes noted several common barriers including policy coherence, a complex reporting landscape, difficulties embedding the NPF in practice as a driver of changes, and dissatisfaction with current funding models. There was support for the development of a Wellbeing and Sustainable Development Bill as well as calls for increased accountability mechanisms including clarifying roles and responsibilities, better scrutiny and improved government transparency of actions taken and progress towards outcomes.

Once analysed, themes, and frequency of occurrences, were distributed across the NPF unit for consideration in the development of the new NPF National Outcomes, associated National Indicator Set, implementation plan and Wellbeing and Sustainable Development (WSD) Bill.

1. **Introduction**

The statutory Review of the National Outcomes seeks to answer the question:

**Do the National Outcomes still reflect the kind of Scotland we want to see?**

The review also seeks to collect evidence on gaps within the implementation of the National Outcomes across Scotland, herein referred to as the “implementation gap”.

We answered the review question by collecting and analysing the following evidence:

* **Desk-based research**

Reviewing existing citizen engagement exercises, community action plans, collating additional evidence, and undertaking the discovery phase for the Wellbeing and Sustainable Development (WSD) Bill focussing on the implementation gap;

* **Written consultation**

Published through Citizen Space, designed to be accessible for members of the public;

* **Call for evidence**

Where organisations and experts can submit their view;

* **Expert stakeholder meetings**

To focus on specific areas (e.g. homelessness, care) as well as the implementation gap (one of the Finance and Public Administration Committee recommendations following their [inquiry into the NPF](https://sp-bpr-en-prod-cdnep.azureedge.net/published/FPA/2022/10/3/a3dd32cb-f846-42db-ada6-11f7e3da9390/FPAS622R8.pdf)) and engagement with the Scottish Youth Parliament.

This document outlines the methodology and results from the data collection and analysis of the four evidence strands by the National Performance Framework (NPF) Evidence and Reporting (E&R) team. Resulting themes will feed into the development of the new NPF National Outcomes, associated indicator set and NPF implementation plan.

1. **Methodology**
   1. **Data Collection**

Data was collected from the following four evidence strands: desk-based research, a public written consultation, a stakeholder call for evidence and expert stakeholder meetings.

The purpose of the desk-based research was to understand what stakeholders and communities have said during the myriad of other engagement and consultation opportunities and how this can be used to support any recommendations for changes to the NPF. The 34 sources included within the desk-based research have been described in [Annex A](#_Annex_A:_Desk-based).

The purpose of the written consultation was to establish the views of the public on the suitability of the National Outcomes as they are. The written consultation was hosted on Citizen Space following the [SG guidelines for consultation best practice](https://www.gov.scot/publications/consultations-in-the-scottish-government-guidance/) from 14th March to 12th June 2023. This consultation was aimed at the general public and included [a consultation information pack to support users to complete the consultation](https://www.gov.scot/publications/national-outcomes-review-2023-consultation-information-pack/) with all the information they needed on the purpose of the NPF, the current National Outcomes and the aim of the consultation. The six questions included within the written consultation have been described in [Annex B](#_Annex_B:_Written).

The purpose of the call for evidence was to allow stakeholders to submit their own research or evidence demonstrating what they would like to see in the new NPF and what needs to happen in order for the NPF to impact on their work. The call for evidence was launched at the same time as the written consultation and ran from 14th March to 12th June 2023. This evidence could have taken many forms, from short paragraphs to multi-page reports, to letters of support for topics, to requests for adaptations to the NPF via emails. The five questions provided as guidance for call for evidence respondents have been described in [Annex C](#_Annex_C_Call).

A series of 11 stakeholder meetings were held between March and June 2023. These sessions were themed and followed a similar workshop format as set out below. In addition, one open session was held with no theme. Most were facilitated by NPFU officials.

The themes covered by the stakeholder meetings were:

* Young people (facilitated by the Scottish Youth Parliament)
* Care and Care Experience
* Business
* Transport
* Housing/homelessness
* Environment (facilitated by the Economy and Environment Leadership Group)
* Sustainable Development Goals
* Gender
* Consumers (facilitated by Consumer Scotland)
* Just transition

The format of the workshops covered three main areas:

* What is good and what should be changed about the National Outcomes
* Why does the theme matter to wellbeing
* How should it be reflected in the National Outcomes
  1. **Data Analysis**

Each piece of evidence was given a unique identifier to anonymise the data prior to analysis. Data was processed and cleaned by removing non-valid responses, duplications, and any offensive material. All removed responses were collated and stored securely for reference. For further information on the results of the data cleaning and final number of responses and/or comments extracted from each evidence strand for analysis, see [Annex D](#_Annex_D_Response).

Summary statistics were produced in excel for quantitative responses to questions 1-3 of the public written consultation.

Thematic analysis of text-based responses was completed manually within excel. Thematic analysis is the process of identifying patterns of meaning within qualitative data and categorising them into themes through coding. During coding, passages of text were extracted from the evidence and assigned codes which represented themes of interest. Each piece of evidence was analysed and coded through the lens of our review question **“**Do the National Outcomes still reflect the kind of Scotland we want to see?” with a focus on the following four areas:

1. Possible changes to the current set of 11 National Outcomes
2. Data gaps and new topics that should be included in the National Outcomes
3. Changes to the wider National Performance Framework or set of National Indicators
4. The main obstacles and barriers in the further implementation of the National Outcomes

For ease of further analysis and distribution across the NPF unit, a coding hierarchy was developed to assist with categorisation. Initial codes were focussed on themes relevant to the above four questions. Thematic analysis is an iterative process, therefore these codes changed over time as we explored the data, found new patterns, and condensed together similar themes. The final themes and sub-themes were split into three categories for distribution and further use:

1. National Outcomes and Indicators
2. Implementation Gap
3. Other

The structure of the final coding hierarchy, including examples, has been set out in [Annex E](#_Annex_E_Thematic).

Although some themes share the same name as the current outcomes, it should be noted that not all comments (and therefore coded themes and sub-themes) were specific requests to change the National Outcomes. Rather themes were developed around the current outcomes for ease of considering topics that were important to respondents and organisations for inclusion in updated outcomes.

Table 1. An example of coded text from thematic analysis of the evidence

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Original Text\* | Category Code | Sub-category Code | Theme Code | Sub-theme Code | Sub-sub-theme |
| educate the public that we all need to play a role in saving the planet and contributing to a sustainable future | National Outcomes and Indicators | Related to Current National Outcomes | Environment | Sustainable development | Improve education |

\*Evidence extracted from the [Doing Politics Differently: Citizens’ Assembly of Scotland (2020)](https://citizensassembly.theapsgroup.scot/report/) report as part of the Desk-based Evidence Strand

In order to quality assure the manual coding process, a 10% sample of the responses were coded into themes by a different person in the team and results compared. Any discrepancies were addressed and resolved by E&R consensus. A double check was completed to ensure that every free-text response had at least one code attached to it so every view was accounted for.

High-level themes and sub-themes were summarised including the number of associated comments. Quotes have been extracted, where permission was given in the Respondent Information Form ([Annex F](#_Annex_F_Respondent)), to demonstrate the length and breadth of the views that were analysed.

1. **Results**
   1. **Written Consultation Questions 1-3 Summary Statistics**

Summary statistics were produced for the quantitative responses to questions 1-3 of the public written consultation (Table 2 and Table 3). Knowledge of the NPF varied with responses across all options on the 1-5 scale. Most respondents had at least some knowledge of the NPF with only 15% of respondents stating they knew nothing at all about the NPF.

Table 2. Responses to Q1 “How much would you say you know about Scotland’s National Performance Framework?” as a percentage of respondents

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Response** | **Respondent Percentage** |
| 1 - nothing at all | 15% |
| 2 | 11% |
| 3 | 29% |
| 4 | 31% |
| 5 - a lot | 13% |

When asked if the current set of National Outcomes fully described the kind of Scotland they wanted to see, two-thirds (66%) responded positively. The percentage of respondents who agreed for individual Outcomes was much higher (83-93%). This suggests that although generally content with the individual outcomes, there were themes missing from the National Outcomes set overall that respondents wanted to see. The highest level of agreement was with the Children and Young People and Environment Outcomes, with 93% of respondents answering “Yes” when asked if the individual outcomes described the kind of Scotland they want to see. The lowest level of agreement was with the Economy Outcome (83%), closely followed by the Poverty and Health Outcomes (both 85%).

Table 3. Percentage of respondents who said “Yes” to Q2 “Do the current set of National Outcomes fully describe the kind of Scotland you want to see?” and Q3 “Does each individual National Outcome describe the kind of Scotland you want to live in?”

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Outcome** | **Percentage who responded "Yes"** |
| National Outcomes Overall | 66% |
| Children and Young People | 93% |
| Environment | 93% |
| Communities | 91% |
| Human Rights | 91% |
| Culture | 90% |
| Education | 90% |
| Fair Work and Business | 89% |
| International | 87% |
| Health | 85% |
| Poverty | 85% |
| Economy | 83% |

* 1. **High-level Themes**

Responses analysed were diverse and covered a wide variety of themes including comments related to all the current outcomes as well as new topics for future consideration. In addition, some comments were very specific requests to change the language of an outcome whilst others were general statements and aspirations for Scotland as a nation. The key themes and sub-themes have been discussed below. Detailed tables of the emerging themes, sub-themes and associated number of comments can be found in [Annex G](#_Annex_G_Thematic_1).

* + 1. **Communities**

The most comments were on the theme of Communities (440) with 30 additional requests to add new communities-related indicators and 24 requests to change or remove current community-related indicators.

The sub-themes within the Communities theme were diverse, with a large focus on local actions rather than specific changes to the National Outcome. This included better infrastructure maintenance of community spaces and facilities as well as improved access to amenities and services, including sports and leisure facilities to increase participation. Other key sub-themes included calls to improve community engagement as well as community resilience, safety, and connectedness.

*“Stromness high street becomes more vibrant, with clean and well maintained pavements, lanes and closes”* – Stromness Local Place Plan

*“No leisure facilities for families/locals”* – Mercat Cross & City Centre Local Community Plan

*“we feel that there is also a gap around community activism, with an outcome that encourages volunteering, activism, community development and involvement in local democracy such as community councils, participatory budgeting and so on”* – Community Enterprise

*“It would be worth bringing in the notion of sustainable communities, resilient communities”* – South Lanarkshire Council

*“People of Greenock South and South West feel safe to go out at night”* - Greenock South and South WestLocality Plan

*“There is the potential to add to the existing outcomes about being “digitally connected”, as this will key across all sectors as we look to the future”* – Scottish Tourism Alliance

*“explicit reference to connectedness, reflecting the centrality of social connections to individual and community wellbeing”* – Mental Health Foundation

Over 300 of these comments were sourced from the desk-based research. Due to the large volume of community action plans analysed through this evidence strand, the focus on communities and actions to improve the local area is unsurprising. The community-themed comments accounted for almost a quarter (24%) of the National Outcomes and Indicators evidence extracted from the desk-based research compared to 1-6% for the other evidence strands.

* + 1. **Education**

There were 361 comments related to the theme of Education with 14 additional requests to add new education-related indicators and 12 requests to change or remove current education-related indicators.

The sub-themes within this were diverse, including calls to action to improve inclusion and diversity within education settings, develop high-quality education professionals and shift focus to practical and lifelong skills development, including digital skills.

*“We heard participants call for a shift in from considering equality as everyone being treated the same to an appreciation that equitable education requires also valuing of the diversity of children, young people, and adults and may involve different approaches and supports to meet their individual and group needs.”* - All Learners in Scotland Matter: national discussion on education final report

*“Teachers in Scotland should be skilled, well-educated, qualified, experienced, and have time for ongoing training and professional development. We heard repeatedly about the importance of better preparation, training and support for teachers and professional staff, at all levels.”* - All Learners in Scotland Matter: national discussion on education final report

*“National outcomes for education seem very youth-focused - can there be a stronger emphasis on community/lifelong learning?”* - Learning for Sustainability Scotland

*“We should ensure that lifelong learning is accessible to all with an equal focus on learning new skills to enable all to contribute to society.”* - Fossoway and District Community Council

270 of these comments came from the desk-based research, with the large majority sourced from analysis of a single data source: the 2023 National Discussion on the Future of Scottish Education. The education-themed comments accounted for almost a fifth (19%) of the National Outcomes and Indicators evidence extracted from the desk-based research compared to 1-7% for the other evidence strands.

* + 1. **Care**

There were 266 comments related to the theme of Care with 90 additional requests to add new care-related indicators. Oxfam Scotland led a campaign, [A Scotland that Cares](https://ascotlandthatcares.org/), backed by over 50 organisations that is calling for a new, dedicated National Outcome focused on care and carers in Scotland to end the invisibility of care in the National Outcomes, alongside the introduction of associated indicators. Several of the signatory organisations, including Oxfam Scotland, Alzheimer Scotland and University of the West of Scotland, provided evidence to support this through the call for evidence, with Oxfam Scotland also submitting a call for evidence response on behalf of the campaign coalition and providing representation at the Care expert stakeholder meeting.

The Care sub-themes were focussed on valuing and supporting carers and those experiencing care as well as the need to recognise the contribution of care to the economy and the universal need and use of social care across people’s lifetime.

*“Over time, a dedicated National Outcome on care will help to recognise care, redistribute care work, reduce the care burden for the individual, better reward paid care work, and allow care workers better representation.”* – University of the West of Scotland

*“I would like to see some acknowledgement about the importance of social care helping people to thrive and live a fulfilling life.”* – Anonymous individual

*“Everyone needs care at some point in this life: as a child, in older age, or due to ill health or disability. The call for a National Outcome on Care encompasses all forms of care. In addition to the significant positive impact of care on people receiving it, helping support them to live their best lives and realise their human rights to health and equal participation in society, care is a benefit to everyone”* - A Scotland that Cares (Campaign Coalition)

There was an even spread of care-themed comments across three of the evidence strands, accounting for 8% of evidence from the written consultation, call for evidence and expert stakeholder meetings. The exception to this was the desk-based research where Care featured in fewer than 5 comments.

* + 1. **Economy**

There were 255 comments related to the theme of Economy with 22 additional requests to add new economy-related indicators and 33 requests to change current economy-related indicators.

The key sub-themes included shifting focus of the National Outcome towards a wellbeing economy that is sustainable, deprioritising economic growth, becoming more locally focussed in supporting independent local businesses and with better, fairer use of resources.

*“There should be mention of a wellbeing economy. Ideally we should move away from the tradition measures of a "successful" economy and look to the health and wellbeing of the whole society, most notably the most vulnerable in society, as a measure of progress and success.”* – Anonymous individual

*“Revise the “Economy” Outcome to make explicit that our economy should serve the purpose of delivering good lives for all people and protect the health of our planet in a way that prioritises collaboration and care over competition and GDP growth.”* – Wellbeing Economy Alliance Scotland

*“Strive to be as self-sufficient as possible, with a competitive Scots circular economy that meets everyone’s needs in a fair way”* – Scotland’s Climate Assembly

There was an even spread of economy-themed comments across all of the evidence strands, suggesting that these themes are important to both individual and organisational respondents through the public and stakeholder engagements.

* + 1. **Human Rights and Equalities/Reducing Inequalities**

There were 240 comments related to the theme of Human Rights and 32 requests to add a related but dedicated equalities/reducing inequalities outcome. As the sub-themes within these two themes were similar, the evidence has been looked at here in combination. There were also 40 requests to add new rights- or equality- related indicators and 13 requests to change or remove current rights-related indicators.

The sub-themes within these themes were diverse, with a large portion of comments related to democratic process improvements such as improving accountability, transparency, upholding justice and citizen involvement in decision-making.

*“Scotland should be a country where the people and government communicate with each other honestly and respectfully; whilst working together with concise and factual information, based on openness and accountability.”* - Doing Politics Differently: Citizens Assembly of Scotland

*“I would like to live in a Scotland that has community-led political decision-making systems, including citizens' assemblies, in place, which allow the emergencies of climate and ecological collapse to be given the due attention and urgent action they require.”* – Anonymous Individual

Other key sub-themes included improving equality, including gender, disability and race equality, and the upholding, respecting and strengthening of rights, including children’s rights.

*“the reference to freedom from discrimination represents a critical dimension of equality. However, it is only a partial view of equality, as it implies only a negative approach to equality by focusing on the avoidance of discrimination. While this is necessary, we must also recognise the national importance of proactively advancing equality by taking specific actions to improve outcomes for people sharing different protected characteristics.”* – Equality and Human Rights Commission

*“The current National Outcomes lack a gendered lens throughout. A gendered lens allows policymakers to understand how those of different genders experience the world, and how this in turn, impacts policy in practice. The current outcomes include vital areas of focus for Scotland, however, unless the Scottish Government attempts to understand how women and men interact with systems differently, these outcomes will never be met. Women we have spoken with have explained that considering the gendered element of the world is key in working towards equity in Scotland and, would like to see this approach taken on a wider scale to tackle women’s oppression.”* – Scottish Women’s Convention

*[I would like to live in a Scotland that…]* *is a world leader in protecting and advocating for rights, where everyone is able to play an active role in shaping society and making decisions which affect their lives, and where resources are directed to those most marginalised and underprivileged in society.”* – Anonymous individual

Almost half of the human rights and equality-related comments were sourced from the written consultation, accounting for over a fifth (22%) of the National Outcomes and Indicators evidence extracted from the written consultation compared to 4-6% for the other evidence strands. This suggests that these themes are important to the private individuals who responded through the public consultation.

* + 1. **Transport, Travel and Connectivity**

There were 225 comments related to the theme of Transport, Travel and Connectivity with 18 additional requests to add new related indicators. A dedicated Transport, Travel and Connectivity theme was extracted due to calls for this to be added to the NPF as a distinct outcome however it is recognised that this theme is closely related to aspects of Communities.

As with Communities, there was a large focus on local actions within the sub-themes including improved infrastructure maintenance, better road safety and traffic calming measures and better public transport services.

*“Carry out an audit of streets and paths to ensure there are good quality cycling paths and well-lit streets”* – Denny, Dunipace and Dennyloanhead Community Action Plan

*“No-car zone for non-residents - supported by better public transport (less car traffic is the future for cities)”* - Mercat Cross & City Centre Local Community Plan

Other key sub-themes included better promotion of active travel as well as recognition of transport as an enabler due to it’s role in physical connectivity.

*“Priorities have changed with net zero and reducing car use so we should reflect that. The impact of transport is significant. The first step is probably to reduce travel. Most travel is over very short distances, could be replaced by means other than cars”* – Transport Expert Stakeholder Meeting Notes

*“Mobility is a vital enabler for disabled people to contribute to every aspect of Scotland’s social, cultural, and economic life. Our position being that transport is an enabler of human rights and must be ‘Available, Accessible and Affordable’.* - Mobility and Access Committee for Scotland

Over two-thirds of the Transport, Travel and Connectivity comments were sourced from the desk-based research. Due to the large volume of community action plans analysed through this evidence strand, the focus on transport, travel and connectivity is unsurprising. These comments accounted for 10% of the National Outcomes and Indicators evidence extracted from the desk-based research compared to 0-6% for the other evidence strands.

* + 1. **Housing and Homelessness**

There were 210 comments related to the theme of Housing and Homelessness with 52 additional requests to add new related indicators.

The sub-themes within this were diverse but key topics included the need for affordable housing, recognition of housing as an enabler to other outcomes and that access to adequate, accessible housing that meets needs is a human right.

*“Affordable housing: Develop housing for local people so that they don't have to move away.”* - Stratherrick and Foyers Community Assembly

*“Social justice cannot be achieved if people do not have a home they can thrive in. A whole system approach is required to address the growing housing emergency and fix the broken and biased housing system. This is why it is so important that housing is prioritised within the National Performance Framework. If urgent action is not taken, we will be unable to address the growing housing emergency and that will make it much more difficult to achieve the National Outcomes particularly those relating to poverty, health, education and employment.”* – Shelter Scotland

*“For there to be specific mention of access to housing and for every one of Scotland's residents to have somewhere safe and secure to live.”* – Anonymous Individual

There was a spread of Housing and Homelessness comments across all the evidence strands (2-9%), suggesting that these themes are important to both individual and organisation respondents through both the public and stakeholder engagements. It should be noted that 40% of comments originated from one expert stakeholder meeting which was specifically focussed on the topic of Housing and Homelessness, with representatives in attendance from various organisations including Crisis, Homeless Network Scotland, Shelter Scotland, Public Health Scotland and the Association of Local Authority Chief Housing Officers.

* + 1. **Health**

There were 187 comments related to the theme of Health with 31 additional requests for a dedicated mental health and wellbeing outcome, 35 requests to add new health-related indicators and 28 requests to change or remove current health-related indicators.

The sub-themes within this were diverse but key topics included the need for parity between physical and mental health within the National Outcomes, higher prioritisation and better support for mental health care, a high-quality healthcare system delivered through a fully supported and resourced NHS and recognition that healthcare is a lifelong right.

*“we would propose new wording to reflect the parity and inter-related nature of mental and physical health and to centre the importance of reducing health inequalities.”* – Mental Health Foundation

*“I want to see a separate national outcome for mental health. A lot of the ills in Society, e.g., substance abuse, alcoholism, criminality, gambling addiction, poverty, domestic abuse, etc have poor mental health. By improving diagnosis, making treatment patient centric, providing early intervention, educating the public on preventative techniques and supporting everyone who needs it, we can make savings in criminal justice, in physical health, improve educational attainment, improve employment outcomes, and reduce economic inactivity.”* – Disability Equality Scotland

*“I think healthy and active is fine, but it leaves out that a large proportion of health is access to free and timely healthcare, and also feels like it focuses on physical health and doesn't touch on mental health.”* – Anonymous Individual

*“have properly resourced and managed health and social care services, built around individuals and communities to achieve good health and wellbeing for all.”* - Doing Politics Differently: Citizens Assembly of Scotland

There was a spread of Health comments across all the evidence strands (2-9%), suggesting that these themes are important to both individual and organisation respondents through the public and stakeholder engagements.

* + 1. **Environment and Climate Action**

There were 168 comments related to the theme of Environment with 67 additional requests for a dedicated climate change outcome. As the sub-themes within these two themes were related, the evidence has been looked at here in combination. There were also 87 requests to add new environment-related indicators and 43 requests to change or remove current environment-related indicators.

The key sub-themes included recognising the dependence on the environment to deliver other outcomes, the need to prioritise combatting climate change, increasing sustainability and achieving net zero targets, actively protecting the environment, reducing waste and improving biodiversity.

*“The natural environment is fundamental to wellbeing and is in a state of crisis, and these facts are inadequately captured by the National Outcomes at present”* - Environment and Economy Leaders Group Engagement Session Notes

*“We consider that the existing outcomes cover the right areas, but the wording of many needs to be refreshed to better reflect the urgency of the climate and nature related emergencies we are facing.”* - NatureScot

*“We believe there is a fundamental need to focus the country’s collective mindset on the climate emergency and the requirement for immediate action”* – Scotland’s Climate Assembly

*“we value, enjoy and actively protect our environment adapting and mitigating against climate change”* – Anonymous Individual

There was a spread of Environment themed comments across all of the evidence strands (4-6%), suggesting that these themes are important to both individual and organisation respondents through the public and stakeholder engagements.

* + 1. **National Indicator Set**

There were 599 requests to add new indicators across most themes with an additional 219 requests to change or remove current indicators. Key indicator sub-themes include adding new Care indicators (90 requests), new Environment indicators (59 requests), new Housing and Homelessness indicators (52 requests), new Fair Work and Business indicators (42 requests) and changing current Environment indicators (42 requests).

The majority (73%) of indicator-specific requests came from the call for evidence and were requested alongside proposed changes to the outcomes. This was the only evidence strand where guidance included a prompt requesting feedback on the indicator set which could account for this evidence strands dominance within the individual indicator-related themes.

Indicator-specific requests were very diverse and generally reflected the individual interests of the responding organisations. For example the Glasgow City Food Plan: Food Education Working Group suggested expanding the scope of over 20 indicators to include food-related data across seven current outcomes (including Environment, Culture, Communities and Economy) alongside their request to have the importance of food better reflected across the whole of the NPF.

*“food can be seen as being at the nexus of our most pressing national and local concerns. It is instrumental in achieving social and environmental justice and in extending sustainability as a cultural value from nature to business, education and communities. Rather than inserting food into any of the indicators or goals of the NPF, we think a holistic approach to food is of paramount importance and propose a holistic inclusion of food across the Framework.”* - Glasgow City Food Plan: Food Education Working Group

Similarly, Close the Gap requested adding/changing over 20 indicators to improve gender mainstreaming within the NPF and track progress in reducing gender inequalities across Scotland.

*“Close the Gap’s primary critique of the National Performance Framework (NPF) is that it is not well-gendered.”* – Close the Gap

In addition to the indicator-specific requests, there were 181 requests on the indicator set overall and 81 requests for better and more data disaggregation. Key sub-themes within the indicator set comments included requests to change how we measure progress, further develop the indicator set and fill data gaps, consider the use of different data types such as lived experience and improve the quality of the underlying data. As with the indicator-specific requests, the majority (92%) of indicator set comments came from stakeholders through the call for evidence or expert stakeholder meetings.

*“The Scottish Government must prioritise ensuring indicators are fully developed and consult with relevant civil society groups and stakeholders to ensure data and indicator selection are fit for purpose.”* – Oxfam Scotland

*“there is a need to change the way that we gather and understand data. This includes going beyond simply evaluating public services to understanding the outcomes and experiences for citizens and communities. It also includes paying greater attention to dimensions of inequality, recognising that population level data sets often ignore the experiences of marginalised groups. Both of these drivers would require blending the existing national indicators with a much greater emphasis on coproduced and qualitative evidence in order to truly understand progress towards delivering National Outcomes.”* – Carnegie UK

*“The indicators would benefit from being updated and should be based on a thorough review and analysis of their effectiveness, relevance, and alignment with the desired outcomes and should reflect current priorities and challenges such as the impacts of Covid-19, the cost-of-living crisis and Brexit.”* – Culture Counts

Indicator themes accounted for 44% of the National Outcomes and Indicators evidence extracted from the call for evidence and 33% of the expert stakeholder meetings evidence compared to 1-3% for the desk-based research and written consultation evidence strands, suggesting that the data and evidence that tracks progress towards the outcomes is an important aspect of the NPF for stakeholders.

* + 1. **Implementation Gap**

There were 874 comments related to the Implementation Gap, focussed around five key themes of Policy (171 comments), Delivery (166 comments), Funding (114 comments), Legislation (98) and Accountability (98).

The key sub-themes within these included the need for better policy coherence, including better alignment of policies and strategies to simplify the complex reporting landscape, embedding the NPF in practice as a driver of change to close the gap between ambitions and delivery, better delivery of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) through the NPF, improved funding models, better use of the NPF in informing budget decisions, support for the development of a Wellbeing and Sustainable Development Bill as well as calls for increased accountability mechanisms including clarifying roles and responsibilities, better scrutiny and improved government transparency of actions taken and progress towards outcomes.

*“one significant barrier to implementation is the lack of guidance that clarifies how public bodies should use the National Outcomes to guide decision making, in the context of a myriad of other policy frameworks. While there are some areas where the National Outcomes are more visibly embedded, there are many places where other statutory duties or non-legislative frameworks are seen to take precedence.”* – Carnegie UK

*“the NPF needs to be used more systematically and explicitly to influence decision making if it is to be the golden thread from which all other policies and strategies connect to delivery on the ground.”* - Finance and Public Administration Committee (FPAC) inquiry report

*“Ensure regular and detailed progress reporting on implementing the SDGs (via the National Outcomes or directly to the UN) in the spirit of the UN’s commitment to localising the implementation of the SDGs.”* – SDG Network Scotland

*“In terms of giving greater profile to the NPF, could new initiatives have to set out which Outcomes they are delivering on. There’s a disconnect between spending and delivery of the National Outcomes.”* – Transport Expert Stakeholder Meeting Notes

*“Strengthen duties to promote National Outcomes through delivering the promised Wellbeing & Sustainable Development Bill and provide clear guidance for implementation.”* – Wellbeing Economy Alliance Scotland

*“looking to the role of existing public audit and scrutiny bodies to support improvement and hold bodies to account for working collaboratively towards the outcomes and to adopt preventative actions and long-term perspectives.”* – Public Health Scotland

These implementation gap-related comments were largely driven by requests from stakeholders through the call for evidence which accounted for over 50% of comments, suggesting that these themes are important to our stakeholders. This may also in part be a product of the data collection method for this evidence strand, where guidance included a prompt to think about what the main obstacles and barriers are in the implementation of the National Outcomes. However, a further quarter of comments were sourced from the expert stakeholder meeting evidence with only 3% of comments coming from the public written consultation responses.

* + 1. **Other Themes**

Of the 345 other comments, 137 were positive comments about the NPF, including that it is a useful high-level vision with good comprehensive coverage of key issues. Positive feedback was received through every evidence strand however the majority (64%) came from the expert stakeholder meetings.

*“Overall aspirational and positive”* – Open Expert Stakeholder Meeting Notes

*“We believe the NPF provides a key message that wellbeing is at the heart of Scotland’s collective ambitions.”* – Scottish Futures Trust

*“We recognise that there is a lot to celebrate and praise about the NPF, including its relevance in tracking progress in a modern society, it’s diversity of important outcomes, and its relevance within Scottish Government.”* - BiGGAR Economics

*“I think that these National Outcomes apply to all societies and to all parts of the United Kingdom and the world. I think that they represent things that we should all aspire to.”* – Anonymous Individual

The most common other themes were requests to improve the format, including accessibility and visual presentation, changes to the website content and functionality, such as better visibility of disaggregated data and simplified site navigation, requests to change the purpose wording to focus on wellbeing and sustainability as well as calls to change the name of the NPF to better reflect that it is a wellbeing framework.

*“I think that a better representation of a wellbeing economy would be “to focus on creating a more successful country with opportunities for all of Scotland to flourish through increased wellbeing, and a sustainable and inclusive economy””* – Anonymous Individual

*“First and foremost, this review of the National Outcomes is an opportunity to enhance and clarify the overarching purpose of the NPF as Scotland’s ‘National Wellbeing Framework’. This should build on the welcome addition during the last review in 2018 of the ‘purpose’ statements, and specifically the aim to: “increase the wellbeing of people living in Scotland”. The name of the NPF should be changed to focus on this. Critically, there should also be meaningful differentiation between this core purpose and the means of achieving it. Specifically, the current aim “to create sustainable and inclusive growth” is a means to support national wellbeing, not an end in itself, and it therefore has no place in the purpose statement.”* – Oxfam Scotland

*“Changing the title from the National Performance Framework to one that better reflects the ambition of the approach would provide a clearer articulation of what the National Outcomes should do for the people of Scotland and have greater relevance to citizens.”* – Carnegie UK

Comments related to these themes were received through every evidence strand however over 90% came from stakeholders through either the call for evidence or expert stakeholder meetings.

1. **Conclusion**

The statutory Review of the National Outcomes seeks to answer the question “Do the National Outcomes still reflect the kind of Scotland we want to see?” and to collect evidence on the implementation gap of the National Outcomes across Scotland.

Analysis of evidence collected through four evidence strands showed that views were diverse, with over 5,000 comments categorised into over 100 themes and 800 sub-themes. Although the NPF generally provides a useful high-level vision with good comprehensive coverage of key issues, there are gaps and areas which could be strengthened to better reflect the kind of Scotland we want to see. Key themes which are underrepresented within the current National Outcomes include: recognising the importance of care, good quality transport and housing, shifting focus towards a wellbeing economy, reducing inequalities, improving mental health, and prioritising climate action to combat climate change.

Analysis of evidence on the implementation gap of the National Outcomes noted several common barriers including policy coherence, a complex reporting landscape, difficulties embedding the NPF in practice as a driver of changes, and dissatisfaction with current funding models. There was support for the development of a Wellbeing and Sustainable Development Bill as well as calls for increased accountability mechanisms including clarifying roles and responsibilities, better scrutiny and improved government transparency of actions taken and progress towards outcomes.

Once analysed, themes and frequency of occurrences, were distributed across the NPF unit:

* all the results were fed into the policy development of the new NPF National Outcomes
* the National Outcomes and Indicators thematic analysis results will feed into the development of the updated National Indicator Set in 2024 to support the new National Outcomes
* the Implementation Gap category of themes, and associated evidence, will feed into the development of the implementation plan. These results were also passed onto the legislation team to continue work on the WSD Bill.
* the Other category of themes will be looked at on an individual basis and taken forward for consideration with relevant members of the NPF unit.

###### Annex A Desk-based Research Data Collection

**Citizen Engagement**

There have been significant efforts made in recent years by Scottish Government (SG) to engage with citizens in new ways, such as through citizens’ assemblies, and on key emerging policy priorities including Covid recovery and climate change. Given the depth of these engagement projects, they offer an opportunity to compare the findings with the current NPF and influence the direction of the review. This has the benefit of including as many voices as possible to the review, without risking further ‘consultation fatigue’, and maximising use of our internal resources.

The various citizen engagement projects discussed below will not respond directly to the questions asked by the NPF review, as that was not their purpose. Nor are they comparable with one another, as they were designed with different objectives and audiences. The citizen engagement reports that have been considered are:

* [Doing Politics Differently: Citizens’ Assembly of Scotland (2020)](https://citizensassembly.theapsgroup.scot/report/)
* [Scotland’s Climate Assembly (2021)](https://webarchive.nrscotland.gov.uk/20220321133037/https:/www.climateassembly.scot/)
* [From Scotland’s Young People: The Scottish Youth Parliament’s Manifesto 2021-2026 (2020)](https://syp.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2020/11/SYPS-11.pdf)
* [If not now, when?: Social Renewal Advisory Board report (2021)](https://www.gov.scot/publications/not-now-social-renewal-advisory-board-report-january-2021/)
* [Scottish Parliament Citizens’ Panel on Covid 19 (2021)](https://archive2021.parliament.scot/20210218CVDCitizensPanelReportFinal.pdf)
* [Covid Recovery Strategy: for a fairer future (2021)](https://www.gov.scot/publications/covid-recovery-strategy-fairer-future/)
* [All Learners in Scotland Matter : National Discussion on Education (2023)](https://www.gov.scot/publications/learners-scotland-matter-national-discussion-education-final-report/)
* What Kind of Scotland? Reviewing the National Outcomes for Scotland through the lens of Children’s Parliament’s programme of work from 2018 to 2023 report (2023: unpublished, *commissioned by NPF Unit)*

**Community Action Plans**

A community action plan is developed with a community (often led by an over-arching community anchor organisation, development trust or community council), identifying what a community wants to achieve, how to do so, and what resources and organisations will need to be involved to make it happen. The action plans that flow from this engagement work offer insights into the priorities for these communities.

The NPF Expert Advisory Group recommended that these be considered as part of the wider engagement activity of the NPF review. Reviewing a range of community action plans from across Scotland, which have been developed over 2015 - 2022 can offer a snapshot of what matters to communities. While these action plans were not designed to respond to the NPF review, they can offer an additional source of information on what matters to the people of Scotland.

The action plans that were analysed for the review are:

* [Tarbert and Skipness Community Trust (Argyll and Bute)](https://static1.squarespace.com/static/56d43fab9f72661c5b332eb9/t/61951f6df7143678408f0f0a/1637162861409/Community+Action+Plan+2016-21+-+Updated+May+2020+V2+Final+%281%29.pdf)
* [Menstrie (Clackmannanshire)](https://www.foundationscotland.org.uk/sites/default/files/2021-02/Menstrie_CAP.pdf)
* [Denny, Dunipace and Dennyloanhead (Falkirk)](https://www.falkirk.gov.uk/services/people-communities/locality-planning/docs/DDD%20Community%20Action%20Plan.pdf?v=202205091356)
* [Stratherrick and Foyers (Highland)](https://www.communityfuture.net/posts/14)
* [St Monans and Abercrombie (Fife)](https://drive.google.com/file/d/1EsFrMFlldMEKEV1if1NKexPnJK6H80Xf/view)
* [Newmilns and Greenholm (East Ayrshire)](https://www.east-ayrshire.gov.uk/Resources/PDF/N/Newmilns-Greenholm-Community-Action-Plan.pdf)
* [Glenkens (Dumfries and Galloway)](https://www.glenkenstrust.org.uk/_files/ugd/a7a70d_97439c2e68af4d06a83ec4d41696ec05.pdf)
* [Harthill (North Lanarkshire)](https://www.communityactionlan.org/files/CAL/HARTHILLFinalCommunityPlan.pdf)
* [Forres (Moray)](http://www.moray.gov.uk/downloads/file116777.pdf)
* [Insch (Aberdeenshire)](https://www.ouraberdeenshire.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2021/02/Insch-Community-Action-Plan-2020-2025.pdf)
* [Sandford and Upper Avondale (South Lanarkshire)](https://www.communityactionlan.org/files/CAL/Sandford/SANDFORDANDAVONDALECommunityPlan-compressed.pdf)
* [Mercat Cross and City Centre (Stirling)](https://www.stirling.gov.uk/media/ghpdcwkz/mercat-cross-local-community-plan.pdf)
* [Galashiels (Scottish Borders)](https://galashielsheartland.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2022/06/Tapestry-Way-Regeneration-Study-Action-Plan_web.pdf)
* [Scalloway (Shetland Islands)](https://www.shetland.gov.uk/downloads/file/1180/re-create-scalloway-action-plan-report)
* [Stromness (Orkney Islands)](https://stromnesscommunity.files.wordpress.com/2020/11/wnfs_place-plan.pdf)
* [Greenock (Inverclyde)](https://www.bing.com/ck/a?!&&p=b6549e2331e608b9JmltdHM9MTcwMjU5ODQwMCZpZ3VpZD0wYjA1N2Y4OC02M2Q2LTZlMjQtMzEwOC02ZDYyNjIwNDZmZGQmaW5zaWQ9NTE5MA&ptn=3&ver=2&hsh=3&fclid=0b057f88-63d6-6e24-3108-6d6262046fdd&psq=825+Locality+Action+Plan+GSSW+3.pdf&u=a1aHR0cHM6Ly93d3cuaW52ZXJjbHlkZS5nb3YudWsvYXNzZXRzL2F0dGFjaC8xMDQ4NC80ODI1LUxvY2FsaXR5LUFjdGlvbi1QbGFuLUdTU1cucGRm&ntb=1)
  + [Auchterarder and Aberuthven (Perth and Kinross)](https://aandaconnected.co.uk/wp-content/uploads/2022/06/CAP-2021-2027-web.pdf)

**Additional Sources of Information**

The following sources have also been reviewed for views on the implementation gap and changes to the National Outcomes or Indicators due to their relevance to wellbeing frameworks and the NPF:

* [Finance and Public Administration Committee (FPAC) inquiry report](https://www.parliament.scot/-/media/files/committees/finance-and-public-administration-committee/20220512_npf_auditorgeneral.pdf)
* [Scottish Leaders Forum report on Leadership, Collective Responsibility and Delivering the National Outcomes](https://scottishleadersforum.files.wordpress.com/2022/03/leadership-collective-responsibility-and-delivering-the-national-outcomes.pdf)
* [Oxfam Scotland report on priorities and recommendations for the Scottish Parliament](https://oxfamapps.org/scotland/wp-content/uploads/2020/11/CARE-CLIMATE-AND-COVID-19-November-23-2020.pdf)
* Carnegie reports on wellbeing: [The implementation of wellbeing frameworks: What barriers are there?](https://eeac.eu/wp-content/uploads/2022/02/The-implementation-of-wellbeing-frameworks-What-barriers-are-there-by-Jennifer-Wallace.pdf#:~:text=Barriers%20%E2%80%93%20Horizontal%20tensions%20%E2%80%A2%20Wellbeing%20approaches%20require,is%20seen%20as%20a%20threat%20to%20formal%20accountability.) And [National Performance Framework Next Steps](https://carnegieuktrust.org.uk/publications/national-performance-framework-next-steps/)
* [Scotland’s International Development Alliance report on 2021-26 Policy Priorities](https://intdevalliance.scot/our-work/influencing-policy/2021-2026-policy-priorities-for-scotland/)
* [HM Government report on the UK’s Voluntary National Review of the Sustainable Development Goals](https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/uks-voluntary-national-review-of-the-sustainable-development-goals)

* [Scottish Government Report on the alignment of the NPF to the Sustainable Development Goals (SDG)](https://www.gov.scot/publications/scotland-sustainable-development-goals-national-review-drive-action/)
* Scottish Government Thematic Gender Review of the National Performance Framework (2023; unpublished internal report)

###### Annex B Written Consultation Questions

The online written consultation consisted of the following six questions:

1. How much would you say you know about Scotland’s National Performance Framework? (1 – nothing at all 5 – a lot)

1 2 3 4 5

1. Do the current set of National Outcomes fully describe the kind of Scotland you want to see?

Yes No

1. Does each individual National Outcome (set out below) describe the kind of Scotland you want to live in?

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| National Outcome | Yes | No |
| **Children and Young People**  We grow up loved, safe and respected so that we realise our full potential |  |  |
| **Communities**  We live in communities that are inclusive, empowered, resilient and safe |  |  |
| **Culture**  We are creative and our vibrant and diverse cultures are expressed and enjoyed widely |  |  |
| **Economy**  We have a globally competitive, entrepreneurial, inclusive and sustainable economy |  |  |
| **Education**  We are well educated, skilled and able to contribute to society |  |  |
| **Environment**  We value, enjoy, protect and enhance our environment |  |  |
| **Fair Work and Business**  We have thriving and innovative businesses, with quality jobs and fair work for everyone |  |  |
| **Health**  We are healthy and active |  |  |
| **Human Rights**  We respect, protect and fulfil human rights and live free from discrimination |  |  |
| **International**  We are open, connected and make a positive contribution internationally |  |  |
| **Poverty**  We tackle poverty by sharing opportunities, wealth and power more equally |  |  |

1. What, if anything, would you change about the National Outcomes?
2. Why would you make these changes?
3. Complete this sentence: “I would like to live in a Scotland that…”

Alongside the consultation questions, respondents were asked to complete a Respondent Information Form ([Annex F](#_Annex_G_Thematic)).

###### Annex C Call for Evidence Guidance

Call for evidence respondents could submit any information they considered relevant to the Review of National Outcomes via Citizen Space or by email to [nationalperformance@gov.scot](mailto:nationalperformance@gov.scot). The following five questions were also provided for guidance only:

1. Are there any changes to the current set of 11 National Outcomes that you would propose? If so, in summary, what would these be?
2. Are there new National Outcomes that should be included in the National Performance Framework, if so why should they be included?
3. Are there any changes you would propose to the wider National Performance Framework or set of National Indicators?
4. What impact does the current National Outcomes have on your work?
5. What are the main obstacles and barriers in the further implementation of the National Outcomes?

Alongside the call for evidence, respondents were asked to complete an abbreviated version of the Respondent Information Form ([Annex F](#_Annex_G_Thematic)) either via email or the About You page on Citizen Space. Respondents were asked for their name, e-mail, organisation, publishing permission and consent to be contacted in the future.

###### Annex D Response Numbers

From the 34 reports and community action plans reviewed through the desk-based research evidence strand, 1,313 relevant comments were extracted for thematic analysis. Different methods of engagement were used to develop these reports, and therefore the number of participants is highly variable. For example, the ‘Doing Politics Differently’ citizens’ assembly comprised of around 100 individuals, whereas the ‘All Learners in Scotland Matter’ discussion included at least 38,000 people. In some cases, the number of individuals involved cannot be identified.

There were 90 responses to the public online consultation. Three responses were removed due to duplication of organisational responses also submitted through the call for evidence. For one further response, the free text responses for questions 3-6 were removed due to lack of relevance however their responses to questions 1-3 remained. Therefore, the final number of responses analysed through this evidence strand was 87. 71 responses were from private individuals with 16 responses submitted on behalf of organisations. An overview of some respondent characteristics have been set out in Table E 1.

Table E 1. Characteristics of respondents to the public online consultation

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Characteristic** | **Percentage of Valid Respondents** |
| **Age** |  |
| 16-30 | 9% |
| 30-39 | 15% |
| 40-49 | 20% |
| 50-59 | 23% |
| 60-69 | 14% |
| 70 or over | 10% |
| Not Answered | 9% |
| **Sex** |  |
| Female | 62% |
| Male | 31% |
| Not Answered | 7% |
| **Do you have any physical or mental health conditions or illnesses lasting or expected to last 12 months or more?** |  |
| Yes | 26% |
| No | 62% |
| Not Answered/prefer not to say | 11% |
| **Are you part or member of a community?** |  |
| Yes | 46% |
| No | 40% |
| Not Answered | 14% |
|  |  |

130 responses were received through the call for evidence either online or via email to the NPF unit. Five responses were removed due to duplication so the final number of responses analysed through this evidence strand was 125.

In total, 110 stakeholders attended the 11 expert stakeholder meetings, with 727 comments extracted for thematic analysis.

###### A diagram of a program Description automatically generatedAnnex E Thematic Analysis Coding Hierarchy

###### Annex F Respondent Information Form

1. **Introduction and purpose**

The RIF is an important and essential part of every consultation carried out via Citizen Space. This document outlines the proposed RIF for the consultation.

1. **Respondent Information Form (RIF)**

The RIF is used to collect information about respondents in order to acknowledge responses, to identify publishing preferences and for consent to be contacted in the future. This information is obtained in two ways, via the About You page on Citizen Space or via a paper RIF.

* Citizen Space: online respondents will be asked for their name, e mail, publishing permission and consent to be contacted in the future via the About You page. Some of the fields are marked mandatory.
* Respondent Information Form (RIF); this is a paper form published with the consultation document which can be used by respondents who want to email or post a response (rather than respond via Citizen Space). The RIF comments for the respondent’s name, address, phone, email, publishing permission and consent to be contacted in the future. NB: unlike Citizen Space, the paper RIF does not explicitly invite respondents to confirm that they have read SG’s privacy policy and consent to their data being used in this way. However Digital recently consulted Data Protection about this and they were content. It’s therefore reasonable to assume that the respondent has read the privacy policy and consented.
* In person events: a paper copy of the RIF will be provided for all participants to complete prior to providing any views at events.

None of the fields on the RIF are mandatory for individuals, and anonymous responses are valid as long as they relate to the subject matter. Organisations should not submit anonymous responses.

The following RIF is a draft version and will be further edited before the consultation goes live on Citizen Space. This version contains questions about protected characteristics. Some of this type of data is regarded by the UK General Data Protection Regulation as ‘special category data’. The NPF unit is allowed to collect this type of data because the review of the National Outcomes complies with the following regulation:

UK General Data Protection Regulation [Article 9](https://www.legislation.gov.uk/eur/2016/679/article/9): 9(g) *substantial public interest*, supported by Data Protection Act 2018, [Sch 1, Part 2, Para 6](https://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2018/12/schedule/1/enacted), *statutory and government purposes*.

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **About you**  Please indicate how you wish your response to the consultation to be handled and, in particular, whether you are content for your response to published. If you ask for your response not to be published, we will still take account of your views in our analysis but we will not publish your response, or quote anything that you have said. All quotes will be anonymous or identified by type of organisation only (e.g. public body, local authority etc) .  To find out how we handle your personal data, please see our [privacy policy](https://www.gov.scot/privacy/). By clicking submit you agree to our privacy policy. | |
| **What is your email address?**  Entering your email address allows you to return to edit your consultation at any time until you submit it. You will also receive an acknowledgement email when you complete the consultation. |  |
| **Are you responding as an individual or an organisation?** | Individual Organisation |
| **What is your organisation?**  If responding on behalf of an organisation, please enter the organisation's name here. |  |
| **Where are you geographically based?** | Write postcode: |
| **Please tell us if you are working in, or have previous experience of, an industry, employment or activity which you think is relevant to this consultation** |  |
| **Would you like to be added to our mailing list to receive our monthly NPF newsletter providing updates on Scotland’s wellbeing?** | Yes No |
| **The Scottish Government would like your permission to publish your consultation response. Please indicate your publishing preference:**  **Information for organisations only:**   * The option *'Publish response only (without name)'*refers only to your name, not your organisation’s name. If this option is selected, the organisation name will still be published where it is given. * If you choose the option *'Do not publish response'*, your organisation name may still be listed as having responded to the consultation in, for example, the analysis report, however we will not include any quotes from your response. | Publish response only (without name)   Do not publish response |
| **How did you find out about the consultation/call for evidence?** |  |
| [**Protected Characteristics**](https://www.gov.scot/publications/scotlands-census-2022-equality-impact-assessment-results-v3-0/pages/5/)  The following questions are about you. These questions are standard diversity questions used by the Scottish Government in our core surveys and we ask these to help identify what is important to different groups within our population. We will regard your response as confidential, and we will treat it accordingly.  To find out how we handle your personal data, please see our [privacy policy](https://www.gov.scot/privacy/). By clicking submit you agree to our privacy policy. | |
| What was your age last birthday? | 1. Answer: 2. Prefer not to say |
| Do you have any physical or mental health conditions or illnesses lasting or expected to last 12 months or more?  If answer **'Yes'** follow up with the second part of the question:  Question: Does your condition or illness/do any of your conditions or illnesses reduce your ability to carry-out day-to-day activities? | 1. Yes  2. No  3. Prefer not to say  1. Yes, a lot  2. Yes, a little  3. Not at all  4. Prefer not to say |
| What is your sex? | Female Male |
| Do you consider yourself to be trans, or have a trans history? Tick ONE box only | Yes  No |
| Which of the following best describes your sexual orientation? Tick **one** box only | Straight / Heterosexual  Gay or Lesbian  Bisexual  Other sexual orientation, please write in:  Prefer not to say |
|  |  |
| Question : What is your ethnic group?  Choose ONE section from A to F, then tick ONE box, which best describes your ethnic group or background | A white paper with black text  Description automatically generated |
| What religion, religious denomination or body do you belong to? Tick **one** box only | None  Church of Scotland  Roman Catholic  Other Christian, please write in below:  Muslim, write in denomination or school below:  Hindu  Buddhist  Sikh  Jewish   Pagan   Another religion or body, please write in: |
| **Household Income**  What is your household's total income from all sources over the last 12 months?  Count income from every person included in the household. Include:   * All earnings (include overtime, tips, bonuses, self-employment) * All pensions * All student grants and bursaries (but not loans) * All benefits and tax credits (such as child benefit, income support or pension credit) * All interest from savings or investments * All rent from property (after expenses) * Other income (such as maintenance or grants)   Do not deduct taxes, National Insurance contributions, Health Insurance Payments, Superannuation payments | Per year  1. Less than £5,200  2. £5,200 to £10,399  3. £10,400 to £15,599  4. £15,600 to £20,799  5. £20,800 to £25,999  6. £26,000 to £36,399  7. £36,400 to £51,999  8. £52,000 to £77,999  9. £78,000 or more |
| **Community** |  |
| Are you part or member of a community? | Yes  No |
| If yes, what community are you part of? | Please write in: |
| **I confirm that I have read the privacy policy and consent to the data I provide being used as set out in the policy.** | I consent |

###### Annex G Thematic Analysis Supplementary Tables

Although some themes share the same name as the current outcomes, it should be noted that not all comments (and therefore coded themes and sub-themes) were specific requests to change the National Outcomes. Rather themes were developed around the current outcomes for ease of considering topics that were important to respondents and organisations for inclusion in updated outcomes.

A sub-theme needs to have at least 10 comments associated with it to be reported on here as an emerging sub-theme. Where a sub-theme has less than 10 comments it has been aggregated into an “Other” sub-theme for reporting purposes.

Table G1. Number of National Outcomes and National Indicators themes and comments

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Sub-category** | **Number of themes** | **Number of comments** |
| Current National Outcomes | 11 | 2,174 |
| National Indicator Set | 7 | 1,138 |
| New Outcomes/Topics | 19 | 943 |
| Cross-cutting | 29 | 396 |
| Data and Reporting | 12 | 158 |
| **Total** | **78** | **4,809** |

Table G2. Number of National Outcomes and National Indicators comments by evidence strand

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Evidence Strand** | **Number of comments** |
| Desk-based Research | 1,454 |
| Written consultation | 586 |
| Call for evidence | 1,715 |
| Expert stakeholder meetings | 1,054 |
| **Total** | **4,809** |

Table G3. Top 5 National Outcomes and National Indicators themes with the most number of comments by evidence strand

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Evidence Strand** | **Sub-category** | **Theme** | **Number of comments** |
| Desk-based Research | Current National Outcomes | Communities | 347 |
| Current National Outcomes | Education | 270 |
| New Outcomes/Topics | Transport, Travel and Connectivity | 150 |
| Current National Outcomes | Economy | 126 |
| Current National Outcomes | Human Rights | 80 |
| Written consultation | Current National Outcomes | Human Rights | 109 |
| New Outcomes/Topics | Care | 48 |
| Current National Outcomes | Education | 42 |
| Current National Outcomes | Communities | 37 |
| Current National Outcomes | Health | 36 |
| Call for evidence | National Indicator Set | Add new indicators | 434 |
| National Indicator Set | Change current indicators | 148 |
| New Outcomes/Topics | Care | 131 |
| National Indicator Set | Indicator set feedback | 103 |
| Current National Outcomes | Economy | 71 |
| Expert stakeholder meetings | National Indicator Set | Add new indicators | 161 |
| New Outcomes/Topics | Housing and homelessness | 90 |
| New Outcomes/Topics | Care | 86 |
| National Indicator Set | Indicator set feedback | 71 |
| New Outcomes/Topics | Transport, Travel and Connectivity | 65 |

Table G4. Number of Comments Related to the Current National Outcomes by Theme

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Theme** | **Number of comments** |
| Communities | 440 |
| Education | 361 |
| Economy | 255 |
| Human Rights | 240 |
| Health | 187 |
| Environment | 168 |
| Poverty | 130 |
| Children and Young People | 123 |
| Fair Work and Business | 114 |
| Culture | 84 |
| International | 72 |
| **Total** | **2,174** |

Table G5. Number of Comments Related to the Current National Outcomes by Theme and Sub-theme

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Theme** | **Sub-theme** | **Number of comments** |  |
| Communities | Community engagement | 78 |  |
| Infrastructure maintenance | 45 |  |
| Community resilience | 39 |  |
| Sports and leisure participation | 33 |  |
| Community safety | 30 |  |
| Access to local amenities | 23 |  |
| Voices heard | 22 |  |
| Change the outcome language | 16 |  |
| Inclusivity and Diversity | 15 |  |
| Tourism | 14 |  |
| Volunteering | 13 |  |
| Access to green and blue space | 12 |  |
| Collaboration | 12 |  |
| Community empowerment | 12 |  |
| Community ownership | 12 |  |
| Transport, Travel and Connectivity | 12 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 52 | \*covers 23 sub-themes |
| Education | Inclusivity and Diversity | 42 |  |
| Education professionals | 30 |  |
| Skills development | 27 |  |
| Digital futures | 26 |  |
| Lifelong learning | 26 |  |
| The curriculum | 23 |  |
| Human centred educational improvement | 22 |  |
| Pathways for all | 20 |  |
| Support Children and young people cultivating positive relationships and attitudes | 16 |  |
| Achieving potential | 14 |  |
| Good health and wellbeing | 13 |  |
| A learning system | 12 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 90 | \*covers 30 sub-themes |
| Economy | Wellbeing economy | 38 |  |
| Locally focussed | 32 |  |
| Tax | 17 |  |
| Better use of empty/derelict buildings | 15 |  |
| Change the outcome language | 14 |  |
| Sustainable | 13 |  |
| Digital inclusion | 12 |  |
| Deprioritise economic growth and GDP | 11 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 103 | \*covers 37 sub-themes |
| Human Rights | Democracy | 64 |  |
| Equality | 15 |  |
| Improvement to rights | 12 |  |
| Childrens rights | 11 |  |
| Respectful | 11 |  |
| Value every citizen | 11 |  |
| Justice | 10 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 106 | \*covers 31 sub-themes |
| Health | Change the outcome language | 26 |  |
| Mental health | 21 |  |
| Physically, mentally and emotionally healthy | 20 |  |
| Fully resourced services | 10 |  |
| NHS | 10 |  |
| Whole of life | 10 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 90 | \*covers 31 sub-themes |
| Environment | Improve interconnectedness between outcomes | 22 |  |
| Climate change | 20 |  |
| Change the outcome language | 20 |  |
| Actively protect | 16 |  |
| Waste management | 14 |  |
| Sustainable development | 12 |  |
| Biodiversity | 11 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 53 | \*covers 24 sub-themes |
| Poverty | Routes out of poverty | 18 |  |
| Change the outcome language | 14 |  |
| Food poverty | 11 |  |
| Finances | 10 |  |
| Support | 10 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 67 | \*covers 21 sub-themes |
| Children and Young People | Sports and Leisure participation | 34 |  |
| Change the outcome language | 22 |  |
| Good health and wellbeing | 12 |  |
| Childrens rights | 10 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 45 | \*covers 17 sub-themes |
| Fair Work and Business | Improved employment opportunities | 32 |  |
| Change the outcome language | 10 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 72 | \*covers 33 sub-themes |
| Culture | Enhance, promote, develop and support community cultural offerings | 54 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 30 | \*covers 14 sub-themes |
| International | Worldwide leaders | 10 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 62 | \*covers 25 sub-themes |

Table G6. Number of Comments Related to the National Indicator Set by Theme

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Theme** | **Number of comments** |
| Add new indicators | 599 |
| Change current indicators | 205 |
| Indicator set feedback | 181 |
| Better disaggregation | 81 |
| Call for intersectional data | 55 |
| Remove indicators | 14 |
| Change indicator structure | 3 |
| **Total** | **1,138** |

Table G7. Number of Comments Related to the National Indicator Set by Theme and Sub-theme

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Theme** | **Sub-theme** | **Number of comments** |  |
| Add new indicators | Care | 90 |  |
| Environment | 59 |  |
| Housing and Homelessness | 52 |  |
| Fair work and Business | 42 |  |
| Consumers and consumer protection | 39 |  |
| Poverty | 36 |  |
| Health | 35 |  |
| Communities | 30 |  |
| Children and young people | 29 |  |
| Climate change, climate resilience and just transition to net zero | 28 |  |
| Human rights | 24 |  |
| Economy | 22 |  |
| Culture | 21 |  |
| International | 19 |  |
| Transport, Travel and Connectivity | 18 |  |
| Safety/violence | 17 |  |
| Education | 14 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 24 | \*covers 5 sub-themes |
| Change current indicators | Environment | 42 |  |
| Economy | 33 |  |
| Health | 25 |  |
| Fair work and Business | 24 |  |
| Communities | 22 |  |
| Poverty | 15 |  |
| Education | 12 |  |
| Children and young people | 11 |  |
| Human rights | 10 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 11 | \*covers 2 sub-themes |
| Indicator set feedback | Measuring progress | 47 |  |
| Fully developed set of indicators | 37 |  |
| Balance of qualitative and quantitative measures | 24 |  |
| Improved data quality | 21 |  |
| Improved data collection | 13 |  |
| Use of external data sources | 11 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 28 | \*covers 6 sub-themes |
| Better disaggregation | Equality data (excluding gender) | 34 |  |
| Gender | 28 |  |
| Geography disaggregation | 15 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 4 | \*covers 3 sub-themes |
| Call for intersectional data | Gender-disaggregated intersectional data needed | 26 |  |
| Call for intersectional data | 14 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 15 | \*covers 9 sub-themes |
| Remove indicators | All sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 14 | \*covers 5 sub-themes |
| Change indicator structure | *No sub-themes* | 3 |  |

Table G8. Number of New Outcome/Topic Comments by Theme

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Theme** | **Number of comments** |
| Care | 266 |
| Transport, Travel and Connectivity | 225 |
| Housing and Homelessness | 210 |
| Climate Change, Climate Resilience and Just Transition to Net Zero | 67 |
| Consumers and Consumer Protection | 38 |
| Mental Health and Wellbeing | 31 |
| Equality/Reducing Inequalities | 27 |
| Safety/Violence | 20 |
| Sport and Physical Activity | 16 |
| Participation/Democracy | 13 |
| Collaboration/Partnerships/Governance | 10 |
| Gender Equality | 5 |
| Older People | 5 |
| Entrepreneurs and Small Businesses | 3 |
| Digital Connectivity | 3 |
| Single Parents | 1 |
| Happiness | 1 |
| Scotland's Resources | 1 |
| Pandemic Recovery | 1 |
| **Total** | **943** |

Table G9. Number of New Outcome/Topic Comments by Theme and Sub-theme

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Theme** | **Sub-theme** | **Number of comments** |  |
| Care | value and support carers | 82 |  |
| value and support those experiencing care | 36 |  |
| language | 18 |  |
| (blank) | 18 |  |
| Care must be a dedicated outcome | 16 |  |
| recognise contribution to economy | 12 |  |
| Social Care | 11 |  |
| Quality of life | 10 |  |
| universal need and use of social care across lifetime | 10 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 53 | \*covers 21 sub-themes |
| Transport, Travel and Connectivity | infrastructure maintenance | 45 |  |
| public transport | 38 |  |
| Active Travel | 38 |  |
| traffic calming and road safety | 26 |  |
| enabler to many outcomes | 13 |  |
| improve interconnectedness | 11 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 54 | \*covers 20 sub-themes |
| Housing and Homelessness | Affordable | 41 |  |
| improve interconnectedness | 25 |  |
| right to adequate housing | 13 |  |
| Accessible | 13 |  |
| Quality | 12 |  |
| sustainable development | 10 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 96 | \*covers 30 sub-themes |
| Climate Change, Climate Resilience and Just Transition to Net Zero | pull into own outcome to reflect priority | 12 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 55 | \*covers 17 sub-themes |
| Consumers and Consumer Protection | All sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 38 | \*covers 17 sub-themes |
| Mental Health and Wellbeing | All sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 31 | \*covers 19 sub-themes |
| Equality/ Reducing Inequalities | All sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 27 | \*covers 12 sub-themes |
| Safety/Violence | All sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 20 | \*covers 7 sub-themes |
| Sport and Physical Activity | All sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 16 | \*covers 8 sub-themes |
| Participation/ Democracy | All sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 13 | \*covers 9 sub-themes |
| Collaboration/ Partnerships/ Governance | All sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 10 | \*covers 6 sub-themes |
| Gender Equality | All sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 5 | \*covers 5 sub-themes |
| Older People | All sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 5 | \*covers 4 sub-themes |
| Entrepreneurs and Small Businesses | All sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 3 | \*covers 3 sub-themes |
| Digital Connectivity | *No sub-themes* | 3 | \*covers 3 sub-themes |
| Single Parents | *No sub-themes* | 1 |  |
| Happiness | *No sub-themes* | 1 |  |
| Scotland's Resources | *No sub-themes* | 1 |  |
| Pandemic Recovery | *No sub-themes* | 1 |  |

Table G10. Number of Cross-cutting Comments and Sub-themes by Theme

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Theme** | **Number of comments** | **Number**  **of Sub-themes** |
| Inclusion and Diversity | 64 | 22 |
| Change of Focus of outcomes as a whole | 58 | 23 |
| Equality/reducing inequalities | 57 | 23 |
| Inter-connected outcomes | 52 | 17 |
| Improve interconnectedness | 36 | 7 |
| Sustainability | 20 | 10 |
| Language | 18 | 13 |
| Prioritise wellbeing | 12 | 2 |
| Prioritise climate emergency action | 11 | 8 |
| Include New and emerging themes | 10 | 8 |
| Thriving | 10 | 3 |
| Recognise value and role of third sector | 7 | 4 |
| Covid recovery | 6 | 6 |
| Lessons learned from others | 6 | 6 |
| De-prioritise growth | 5 | 5 |
| Provides universal opportunity | 5 | *No sub-themes* |
| Whole of Life | 5 | 3 |
| Resilience | 3 | 3 |
| Devolved administrations | 1 | *No sub-themes* |
| Expansive | 1 | *No sub-themes* |
| Food | 1 | *No sub-themes* |
| Forward thinking | 1 | *No sub-themes* |
| Happy | 1 | *No sub-themes* |
| Justice | 1 | *No sub-themes* |
| Natural capital | 1 | *No sub-themes* |
| Provides | 1 | *No sub-themes* |
| Responsibility | 1 | *No sub-themes* |
| Supportive | 1 | *No sub-themes* |
| Vibrant | 1 | *No sub-themes* |
| **Total** | **396** | **163** |

Table G11. Number of Data and Reporting Comments and Sub-themes by Theme

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Theme** | **Number of comments** | **Number of Sub-themes** |
| Reporting | 38 | 8 |
| Include targets | 37 | 10 |
| Measure outcome progress | 18 | 9 |
| Improve alignment | 17 | 5 |
| NPF as driver of change | 17 | 6 |
| SDGs | 9 | 6 |
| Equality analysis | 5 | 3 |
| Overcome data access/sharing issues | 5 | 2 |
| Lessons learned | 4 | 4 |
| Evidence informed delivery | 3 | 3 |
| Tools and guidance | 1 | *No sub-themes* |
| Invest and resource | 1 | *No sub-themes* |
| *No theme* | 3 | *No sub-themes* |
| **Total** | **158** | **56** |

Table G12. Number of Implementation Gap Comments by Theme

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Theme** | **Number of comments** |
| Policy | 171 |
| Delivery | 166 |
| Funding | 114 |
| Legislation | 98 |
| Accountability | 98 |
| Comms & Engagement | 72 |
| Collaboration | 69 |
| Guidance and tools | 52 |
| Stronger leadership | 24 |
| Capacity building | 6 |
| Impact assessments | 4 |
| **Total** | **874** |

Table G13. Number of Implementation Gap Comments by Theme and Sub-theme

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Theme** | **Sub-theme** | **Number of comments** |  |
| Policy | policy coherence | 144 |  |
| Gaps between strategy ambitions/policy and delivery | 27 |  |
| Delivery | NPF as driver of change | 37 |  |
| how do we achieve the outcomes | 28 |  |
| targeted operational plans | 21 |  |
| SDG delivery | 16 |  |
| strategy | 15 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 49 | \*covers 20 sub-themes |
| Funding | interventions/services requiring funding | 29 |  |
| how is the NPF is used to inform budget decisions | 28 |  |
| improving funding allocation model | 19 |  |
| invest & incentivise | 12 |  |
| identify and provide source of funding | 10 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 16 | \*covers 3 sub-themes |
| Legislation | Wellbeing & Sustainable Development Bill | 85 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 13 | \*covers 8 sub-themes |
| Accountability | increase scrutiny | 25 |  |
| government transparency | 24 |  |
| Clarify roles and responsibilities | 21 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 28 | \*covers 13 sub-themes |
| Comms and Engagement | increase awareness | 43 |  |
| Engagement | 20 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 9 | \*covers 2 sub-themes |
| Collaboration | whole system approach | 34 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 35 | \*covers 15 sub-themes |
| Guidance and tools | develop resources on how to monitor and report progress | 23 |  |
| develop resources on how to use and embed the NPF | 16 |  |
| Other sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 13 | \*covers 4 sub-themes |
| Stronger leadership | All sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 24 | \*covers 8 sub-themes |
| Capacity building | All sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 6 | \*covers 6 sub-themes |
| Impact assessments | All sub-themes with <10 comments\* | 4 | \*covers 4 sub-themes |

Table G14. Number of Other Comments and Sub-themes by Theme

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **Theme** | **Number of comments** | **Number of Sub-themes** |
| Positive Feedback | 137 | 19 |
| Format | 48 | 21 |
| Website | 38 | 22 |
| 2023 Review Consultation Feedback | 25 | 8 |
| change purpose wording | 23 | 15 |
| change name of NPF | 21 | 3 |
| Language | 20 | 12 |
| citizen engagement | 13 | 5 |
| unrelated to NPF | 8 | *No sub-themes* |
| change values wording | 6 | 3 |
| Scope | 3 | 3 |
| General issues | 3 | 3 |
| **Total** | **345** | **114** |

ANNEX 4: Revised National Outcomes

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| **NATIONAL PERFORMANCE FRAMEWORK** | | |
| PURPOSE: **To improve the wellbeing of people living in Scotland, now and in the future** | | |
| **CARE** | We are cared for as we need throughout our lives and value all those providing care | We recognise that everyone needs care at some point in their life: as a child, in older age, or due to ill health or additional needs. We acknowledge the intrinsic value of caring for collective wellbeing and also the economic value of unpaid care that often goes unnoticed. We support and invest in care so that nobody providing paid or  unpaid care experiences poverty, disadvantage or reduced wellbeing. We have a care sector that provides fair work and dignified, respectful care to all who need it.  We reduce inequality through our actions to support caring, which is disproportionately carried out by women. We improve the lives of children, older people, and disabled people by ensuring high quality care. Disabled people can access the support they need to live independently.  Everyone is cared for through their early years, as we support families, the childcare sector and care providers to look after children and young people. Children looked after in the care system feel loved and nurtured throughout their lives and have everything they need to thrive.  We recognise that for some, such as young carers, caring and being cared for happen at the same time. The right support is available for young carers to ensure they can be children first and foremost.  We recognise that our population is ageing, and provision is made for this. Older people are supported through appropriate services to live well and as independently as possible. |
| **CHILDREN AND YOUNG PEOPLE** | We grow up loved, safe and respected and every single one of us can realise our full potential | We uphold the human rights of all children and young people and do all we can to ensure they grow up in an environment of happiness, love and understanding, through which they can flourish. We recognise that children and young people are not simply future adults but human beings in their own right. We treat every child and young person as an individual and acknowledge that some children may face barriers that require special consideration. We involve children and young people in decisions about their lives and world and provide opportunities for them to participate in decision making processes.  Children and young people have strong, healthy relationships with their caregivers, family and wider social network. Families are supported as needed to raise their children in a nurturing and safe environment, and we ensure the same for those children who are care experienced.  We enhance life chances through access to schools, early years provision and other activities that are caring, respectful and encouraging places where everyone can learn, play and flourish.  Our communities – both physical and virtual - are safe places where children and young people are valued and treated with kindness. We provide the conditions in which all children can be healthy and active, both mentally and physically. We provide children and young people with hope for the future and create opportunities for them to fulfil their dreams. We are committed to a childhood for every child that fully prepares them to live a full life. |
| **CLIMATE ACTION** | We live sustainably, achieve a just transition to net zero and build Scotland’s resilience to climate change | We are taking the decisive, urgent climate action necessary to reach net zero greenhouse gas emissions. We act upon the interconnected climate and nature emergencies. We recognise that we must adapt and build resilience to the changing climate.  We shift to renewable forms of heat and energy, providing warm homes and energy security for communities. We reduce the climate impact of the food we produce, consume and throw away, and create more resilient food systems. Our transport networks enable affordable, integrated, accessible and low carbon travel for all. Walking, cycling and wheeling are safe and convenient options for everyday journeys.  In our fair society, we ensure a just transition that benefits people and planet by supporting green jobs and resilient communities. We build an economy that thrives within planetary boundaries.  We acknowledge our global impact and deepen our global leadership on international climate justice. We minimise our emissions through a circular economy that ensures responsible production, consumption and use of materials. Our waste management is effective and maximises recycling. Through our actions we reduce our impact on the climate change that disproportionately harms more vulnerable communities across the world. |
| **COMMUNITIES** | We live in communities that are connected, inclusive, empowered, resilient and safe | We live in thriving communities with access to all the local services and amenities we need to live full lives. We value the idea of community in its widest sense, and the benefit that communities of interest can bring to our lives. We recognise the importance of connection with others to wellbeing. Communities are empowered to make decisions about the issues that matter to them. Our communities are safe places that are welcoming to everyone. We have low levels of crime. We acknowledge that different approaches may be needed to enable all groups to feel safe in public spaces.    Communities offer what we need at all stages of life, from childhood to later years, and we support families and older people with the relevant services to enable everyone to meaningfully participate in community life. Our infrastructure, buildings and spaces are well maintained and accessible to all. Greenspace, leisure, arts and sports facilities are available and encourage recreational activity and social interaction. We plan our places to enable walking, wheeling and cycling for everyone.    We are fully connected to our community and further afield through universal digital access and excellent transport networks that are sustainable, affordable, accessible, reliable and integrated. We recognise that communities have diverse needs and support our rural, urban and island places to flourish. Strong communities have greater resilience in challenging times with volunteering and local networks that are responsive and supportive. |
| **CULTURE** | We are creative and our vibrant and diverse cultures are expressed and enjoyed widely | Our culture, arts and events, including sporting events, bring happiness to our everyday lives as well as attracting international attention. We have a thriving tourist economy that is sustainable for local communities.  We celebrate and nurture our history, heritage and languages, including Gaelic, while embracing the diversity of modern Scotland. Culture, religion and beliefs are respected.  Our culture and events sector flourishes, bringing social and economic benefits through broad ranging activities that are accessible to all. There are opportunities to work in sustainable creative industries.  We support our communities to experience local cultural offerings including events and festivals, libraries, leisure facilities, arts and heritage sites. |
| **WELLBEING ECONOMY AND FAIR WORK** | We have a competitive, entrepreneurial economy that is fair, green and growing, with thriving businesses and industry and fair work for everyone. | We have a flourishing economy, operating within safe environmental limits which serves and prioritises the collective wellbeing of current and future generations. We recognise that investing in a strong wellbeing economy can drive economic prosperity and support incomes, jobs and quality of life for everyone.  Economic development takes a whole-system, partnership approach between public, private, voluntary and community spheres, helping to reduce poverty and inequality and improve health and living standards across all of Scotland.  We have fully embedded circularity, sustainable use of resources, responsible consumption and community wealth building approaches to build an economy that works for us all, supports our communities and protects our environment. We understand the economy plays a key role in solving the climate and nature crises, and harness opportunities in developing green skills, industries and technologies.  We are well connected across urban, rural and island communities. Digital inclusion ensures full participation in the economy. Our transport networks support access to goods and services and movement of freight. We have confident, empowered consumers who are enabled to make sustainable decisions.  Our economy is competitive and entrepreneurial. We have good international trade, investment and export networks. We are an attractive place to do business. We support our existing sectors to continue to thrive while unlocking the potential of new sectors and industries.  We recognise the crucial role of businesses of all types and support our Small and Medium Enterprises.  Fair work is accessible to all, and we reduce inequalities. Good quality jobs, availability of flexible working and reducing barriers to the labour market are good for the economy as well as our people. We reduce unfair pay gaps. We acknowledge the role of different sectors, including the third and voluntary sector, in providing quality employment. We have a highly skilled and educated workforce.    We share wealth and economic power more equally, and the people of Scotland have a greater stake in our economy, making it work better for our communities and planet. |
| **EDUCATION AND LEARNING** | We are well educated, have access to high quality learning throughout our lives and are able to contribute to society | We learn throughout our lives, enriching ourselves and our skills. We provide excellent education for all our children and young people through an education system that meets everyone’s needs and prepares them for the future. Our education professionals are valued and empowered to provide high quality learning and teaching. Schools support good mental health and wellbeing and are inclusive places that can respond to diverse needs.  Our universities and colleges provide lifelong opportunities to learn. Our high-quality research is world leading and we exchange our knowledge with others globally.  We recognise that learning happens in many ways and settings – in the home, in communities, at educational establishments and through work. Skills development is supported. All forms of learning are valued and enable us to contribute to society and the economy. |
| **ENVIRONMENT** | We actively protect, restore, enhance and enjoy our natural environment | We recognise the value of our natural environment for our health, society, economy and wellbeing, and that humanity exists within our planet’s ecological limits. We acknowledge the urgent need to protect, restore and regenerate our environment, and to increase biodiversity. We play our full role in tackling the global nature emergency.  We have clean and unpolluted air, water and soils. We use nature-based solutions and **we promote sustainable planning, development and use of our land and marine areas.** We adapt to the changing climate to manage the impact of weather systems and events.  Access to a healthy, high-quality environment is a right available to all, and we enjoy our landscapes, coastline and green spaces responsibly. |
| **EQUALITY AND HUMAN RIGHTS** | We respect, protect and fulfil human rights and live free from discrimination | We recognise and protect the intrinsic value of all people and are a society founded on fairness, dignity, equality and respect.  We are committed to equality, inclusion and fulfilling human rights at home and abroad. We recognise that human rights are universal, indivisible, interdependent and interrelated. We oppose discrimination and strive to improve outcomes for everyone. We tackle persistent inequalities together, recognising the disadvantage that is faced by certain groups including where forms of disadvantage intersect.  We continue to embed equality and human rights across our decision making and service delivery. We promote gender equality and address discrimination against women and girls.  We live in a well governed society. We actively enable citizens to participate in democratic processes through empowering communities, participation in decision-making and open, transparent government processes.  We have a fair, effective and accessible justice system. We live free from all forms of violence, including violence against women and girls. |
| **HEALTH** | We are mentally and physically healthy and active | We experience the best mental and physical health possible at every stage of our lives. We focus on preventing ill health and maximising good health and wellbeing. We understand that this requires a whole system approach that addresses the underlying causes of ill health and that this is a responsibility we all share. Healthy and affordable food is available to all communities. We minimise the impact of unhealthy food, tobacco, alcohol and drugs, and provide support where this is required. We have active everyday lives through walking, wheeling and cycling, and wide participation in sport and exercise. Access to clean air and green spaces promotes better health.  We support and invest in our NHS to ensure it can provide the right care at the right time and is resilient when faced with current and future challenges. Our healthcare workforce are valued. The facilities that enable good health and access to healthcare are available in communities, including recreation and leisure, local health services and support services. We recognise the value of communities and the third sector in supporting health and social care.  We recognise the differing health needs and inequalities across our population, and ensure that everyone, including women, children, older people, disabled people and those living in rural or island communities, and those experiencing socio-economic disadvantage, have access to the most appropriate services and care to meet those needs.  Social care is integrated and person centred and can help to support the healthcare system. We provide compassionate and respectful care until the end of life to improve wellbeing in all circumstances. |
| **HOUSING** | We live in safe, high-quality and affordable homes that meet our needs | We ensure that everyone has housing that is safe, secure, accessible and affordable. Homelessness and the causes of homelessness are addressed. There is availability of housing of all tenures, including social housing, in our urban and rural areas.  We plan our communities sustainably to ensure there is suitable, good quality housing for all types of households and access to local services. Housing is sustainable, energy efficient, resilient and well maintained.  Housing meets everyone’s needs, throughout all stages of life. We are supported to live independently within our communities. |
| **INTERNATIONAL** | We are connected, open, show leadership and make a positive contribution globally. | Being a good global citizen is a responsibility we all share. We recognise that we are all interconnected, within Scotland and across the globe. We understand that the decisions that impact our own wellbeing here and now will also have wider effects internationally and in the future.  We are committed to promoting peace, democracy and human rights globally. We provide global leadership through positive international relations, our support for international development and our climate action.  We promote our place in the world and deepen our relationships with others, building influence and exchange networks. We collaborate to maximise the contribution of our research and innovation. We enhance our prosperity, and that of our businesses and industry, through international trade and supply chains.  We welcome all who choose to visit, live and work in Scotland and value the positive contribution they make. |
| **REDUCE POVERTY** | We tackle poverty by sharing opportunities, wealth and power more equally | We reduce poverty to ensure that everyone has access to suitable housing, food, heat, energy, transport, and material goods, and strive towards full equality regardless of background. We recognise the links between poverty and gender, ethnicity, disability and health, and act to reduce inequalities.  We remove barriers to education and employment. Fair work, social security, fair taxation and wealth distribution provide routes out of poverty.  Anyone experiencing poverty is treated with dignity and respect. We support families who need it, to become financially secure so that children do not grow up in poverty. We tackle deep-seated and multi-generational child poverty to stop the cycles that reduce opportunity, and that lead to further inequalities. |

ANNEX 5: Current National Indicators

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **INDICATOR NAME** | |
| A positive experience for people coming to Scotland | Access to green and blue space |
| Access to justice | Access to superfast broadband |
| Attendance at cultural events or places of culture | Biodiversity |
| Carbon footprint | Child Material Deprivation |
| Child social and physical development | Child wellbeing and happiness |
| Children have positive relationships | Children's voices |
| Clean seas (aka Marine Environment) | Community ownership |
| Condition of protected nature sites | Confidence of children and young people |
| Contractually secure work | Contribution of development support to other nations |
| Cost of living | Crime victimisation |
| Economic growth | Economic participation |
| Educational attainment (has sub-measures) | Employee voice |
| Employees on the living wage | Energy from renewable sources |
| Engagement in extra-curricular activities | Entrepreneurial activity |
| Food insecurity | Gender balance in organisations |
| Greenhouse gas emissions | Growth in the Arts, Culture and Creative Economy |
| Health risk behaviours | Healthy life expectancy (has sub-measures) |
| Healthy start | Healthy weight (has sub-measures) |
| High growth businesses | Income Inequality |
| Influence over local decisions | Innovative businesses |
| International exporting | International relationships |
| Journeys by active travel | Loneliness |
| Mental wellbeing | Natural Capital |
| Participation in a cultural activity | Pay gap |
| People working in arts, culture and creative industries | Perceptions of local area |
| Perceptions of local crime rate | Persistent poverty |
| Physical activity | Places to interact |
| Premature mortality | Productivity |
| Public services treat people with dignity and respect | Quality of children's services |
| Quality of healthcare experience | Quality of public services |
| Relative poverty after housing costs | Resilience of children and young people |
| Satisfaction with housing | Scotland's population |
| Scotland's reputation | Skill profile of the population |
| Skill shortage vacancies | Skills under-utilisation |
| Social capital | Spend on research and development |
| State of historic sites | Sustainability of fish stocks |
| The number of businesses | Trust in public organisations |
| Unmanageable debt | Visits to the outdoors |
| Waste generated | Wealth inequality |
| Work place learning | Work related ill health |
| Young people's participation |  |

1. What kind of Scotland? 2018 [Publications - Children's Parliament (childrensparliament.org.uk)](https://www.childrensparliament.org.uk/about-us/publications/) [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. General Comment No. 1: The Aims of Education (article 29) (2001) <https://www.ohchr.org/en/resources/educators/human-rights-education-training/general-comment-no-1-aims-education-article-29-2001> [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. What is recovery? <https://medicine.yale.edu/psychiatry/care/cmhc/recovery/> [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. Child Poverty Action Group <https://cpag.org.uk/cost-of-the-school-day> [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. The United Nations describes the role of human rights defenders here: <https://www.ohchr.org/en/special-procedures/sr-human-rights-defenders/about-human-rights-defenders#:~:text=Human%20rights%20defenders%20seek%20the,economic%2C%20social%20and%20cultural%20rights> [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. X <https://www.ohchr.org/en/events/days-general-discussion-dgd/2018/2018-day-general-discussion-protecting-and-empowering> [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. A [International and Canadian Child Rights Partnership - Toronto Metropolitan University (torontomu.ca)](https://www.torontomu.ca/international-canadian-child-rights-partnership/) [↑](#footnote-ref-7)